



LIBERTARIAN PARTY NATIONAL CONVENTION

ROSEN CENTRE, ORLANDO, FL

MAY 27-30, 2016

CURRENT STATUS:

REVISION #:

VERSION LAST UPDATED:

DRAFT

3

APRIL 8, 2017

LEGEND for amendment notations:

Text proposed to be inserted, ~~Text proposed to be deleted~~, Unchanged existing text

CALL TO ORDER

The regular biennial convention of the Libertarian Party was called to order at the Rosen Centre in Orlando, Florida at 8:40 a.m. on Friday, May 27, 2016. LNC Chair Nick Sarwark served as convention chair (except where specifically noted), and LNC Secretary Alicia Mattson served as convention secretary for the duration.

Brief welcoming remarks were given by Char-Lez Braden, Chair of the Libertarian Party of Florida.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE REPORT

Emily Salvette, as Chair of the Credentials Committee, presented the initial credentials report.

The list of individuals certified by the Credentials Committee as being eligible to register at the convention contained 994 delegates and 340 alternates.

Ms. Salvette reported that the Oregon faction in control of ballot access had chosen to not send a delegation, so the Credentials Committee listing includes no Oregon delegation.

Ms. Salvette reported current registration as being 446 delegates and 35 alternates who are entitled to cast 481 votes. Quorum is 193.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention.

Elisheva Levin (NM) moved to amend the credentials committee report to seat the 4 delegates who have come from Oregon. Mr. Sarwark ruled the motion out of order.

M Carling (WA) raised a point of order that of the two factions each claiming to be the Oregon affiliate, the one whose delegates were seated by the 2012 and 2014 conventions, which is recognized by the LNC, the national Judicial Committee, and the Judicial Committee of Oregon did wish to send a delegation and had submitted a delegate listing in accordance with the national bylaw requirements. Aaron Starr (CA) raised a point of order that this is a contested delegation and should be handled by those rules as provided by Robert's Rules. Mr. Sarwark ruled that there is not a contested delegation because the Credentials Committee has chosen which one to recognize, and Mr. Starr's requests for information about the findings of various entities and about Robert's Rules were not germane to the main motion to approve the Credentials Committee report. Joshua

Katz (CT) appealed the ruling of the chair that it is out of order to seat an Oregon delegation, citing RONR p. 614 – 616 regarding the right of the convention to decide questions of contested delegations¹. Mr. Sarwark explained his ruling, that it would violate our bylaws to seat a delegation from any Oregon group except the one which the Secretary of State in Oregon allows to use the Libertarian Party ballot access, and that group specifically said they would send no delegation. Mr. Carling raised a point of order that status with the Secretary of State is not the basis on which our affiliates are identified, that the legitimate affiliate met the bylaw requirements and wishes to seat delegates, and our bylaws require that we recognize them.

Following debate, the ruling of the chair was sustained with a standing vote.

The main motion to establish the voting roll of the convention was adopted by a voice vote.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

A proposed agenda had been printed for the delegates, and the convention took up an implied motion to adopt the agenda as proposed.

George Phillies (MA) moved to amend the agenda to:

- shorten the Bylaws and Rules Committee report by 30 minutes on the morning of Friday, May 27;
- add 30 minutes on the morning of Friday, May 27, to allow bylaw amendments from the floor;
- shorten the Platform Committee report by 60 minutes on the morning of Saturday, May 28; and
- insert 60 minutes on the morning of Saturday, May 28, for platform amendments or resolutions from the floor

Mr. Sarwark ruled that the motion would require 2/3 as a suspension of the rules because it conflicts with the agenda template set in the Convention Special Rules of Order.

Daniel Hayes (LA) moved to amend the Phillies motion so it would instead be to subtract 30 minutes from the Bylaws and Rules Committee report and subtract 30 minutes from the Platform Committee report. The Hayes amendment failed by a show of hands.

The Phillies amendment failed by a standing vote.

Kevin Ludlow (TX) moved to amend the proposed agenda to insert 5 minutes on Saturday morning immediately following the Credentials Committee report, and before the Platform Committee report, for him to give a preview of the new website under development. The amendment was adopted without objection.

The main motion to adopt the agenda as amended was adopted by a voice vote.

TREASURER'S REPORT

LNC Treasurer Tim Hagan presented the treasurer's report, referencing delegate materials which contained audited financials for fiscal years ending December 2013 and December 2014 as well as unaudited financials for fiscal year ending December 2015.

BYLAWS AND RULES COMMITTEE REPORT

Nathan Gall (WI) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to address a resolution regarding the 2020 presidential nominating convention. The motion failed by a voice vote.

At 9:33 a.m. M Carling, as Chair of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, began presentation of the committee's report.

REQUIRE AUDIT COMMITTEE TO REPORT TO CONVENTION DELEGATES

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws and the convention special rules of order as follows:

ARTICLE 10: FINANCE AND ACCOUNTING

1. The fiscal term of the Party shall begin on January 1 of each year. From January 1 until the National Committee has approved a budget, the Treasurer may authorize expenditures for any item incorporated in the previous year's budget as long as the level of expenditure is consistent with that budget.
2. The National Committee shall cause an efficient double-entry system of accounts to be installed and maintained. Financial statements of the Party shall be prepared in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP). Audits shall be performed annually by an independent auditor. The non-officer members of the National Committee shall appoint a standing Audit Committee of three members with power to select the independent auditor. One member shall be a non-officer member of the National Committee and the other two shall not be members of the National Committee. The Audit Committee shall [present its findings to each Regular Convention and](#) clarify for the National Committee any recommendations made by the auditor.

RULE 1: ORDER OF BUSINESS

The standing order of business for a Regular Convention shall be as follows:

1. Call to order
2. Credentials Committee report
3. Adoption of agenda
4. Treasurer's report
5. [Audit Committee report](#)
- ~~6-6.~~ Bylaws and Rules Committee report
- ~~6-7.~~ Platform Committee report
- ~~7-8.~~ Nomination of Party candidates for President and Vice-President (in appropriate years)
- ~~8-9.~~ Election of Party Officers and at-large members of the National Committee
- ~~9-10.~~ Election of Judicial Committee
- ~~10-11.~~ Resolutions
- ~~11-12.~~ Other business

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a show of hands.

CLARIFY THE ROLE AND COMPOSITION OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 10: FINANCE AND ACCOUNTING

1. The fiscal term of the Party shall begin on January 1 of each year. From January 1 until the National Committee has approved a budget, the Treasurer may authorize expenditures for any item incorporated in the previous year's budget as long as the level of expenditure is consistent with that budget.
2. The National Committee shall cause an efficient double-entry system of accounts to be installed and maintained. Financial statements of the Party shall be prepared in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP). Audits shall be performed annually by an independent auditor.
3. [Audit Committee](#). The non-officer members of the National Committee shall appoint a standing Audit Committee of three members with power to select [and engage](#) the independent auditor. One member ~~shall~~ [may](#) be [either](#) a non-officer member [or an alternate](#) of the National Committee and the other two shall not be

members or alternates of the National Committee. The officers and employees of the Party shall have no authority to contravene the Audit Committee's instructions to the auditor. The Audit Committee shall clarify for the National Committee any recommendations made by the auditor.

Following debate, the motion failed by a show of hands. No amendments were offered for consideration.

VERIFICATION OF DELEGATION VOTE TOTALS

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the convention special rules of order as follows:

RULE 10: VERIFICATION OF DELEGATION VOTE TOTALS

For each vote in which subtotals are submitted by delegation, each delegation shall conduct its vote by written ballot. After each delegation has tabulated its own vote totals, before submitting the totals to the Secretary, tellers approved by the Secretary shall review the ballot tabulation for accuracy and cosign the delegation totals.

After the Secretary has recorded all delegation submissions, the state-by-state delegation totals for each candidate or choice shall be displayed on a projection screen for each delegation to review for accuracy.

David Stewart (OK) moved to divide the question to consider the two paragraphs separately. A voice vote on dividing the question was inconclusive; the motion was adopted on a show of hands.

Following debate, the proposed title and the first paragraph were adopted by a show of hands. The second paragraph was also adopted by a show of hands.

REQUIRE NATIONAL DELEGATES TO BE PARTY MEMBERS

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

3. Delegates:

a. Delegates shall be required to be members of ~~either the Party or an affiliate party~~. At all Regular Conventions delegates shall be those so accredited who have registered at the Convention. At all Non-Regular Conventions, any person who wishes to attend may do so.

Proviso: This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted.

Following debate, the motion failed by a show of hands. Pursuant to Convention Rule 4, the motion was opened for amendments.

Starchild (CA) moved to amend the proposal such that it would instead read as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

3. Delegates:

a. Delegates shall be required to ~~be members of either the Party or an affiliate Party~~ sign the Libertarian Party's non-aggression pledge. At all Regular Conventions delegates shall be those so accredited who have registered at the Convention. At all Non-Regular Conventions, any person who wishes to attend may do so.

Proviso: *This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted.*

Following debate, the Starchild amendment failed by a show of hands.

Marc Montoni (VA) moved to amend the committee proposal to insert "sustaining or higher" before "members" such that it would instead read as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

3. Delegates:

a. Delegates shall be required to be sustaining or higher members of ~~either the Party or an affiliate party~~. At all Regular Conventions delegates shall be those so accredited who have registered at the Convention. At all Non-Regular Conventions, any person who wishes to attend may do so.

Proviso: *This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted.*

Following debate, the Montoni amendment failed by a show of hands.

Pat Dixon (TX) moved to amend the committee proposal such that it would instead read as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

3. Delegates:

a. Delegates shall be required to be members of the party as defined in Article 5 ~~of either the Party or an affiliate Party~~. At all Regular Conventions delegates shall be those so accredited who have registered at the Convention. At all Non-Regular Conventions, any person who wishes to attend may do so.

Proviso: *This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted.*

Following debate, the Dixon amendment was ruled failed on a show of hands. Division was demanded. The Dixon amendment was initially ruled failed by a standing vote until Tom Howe (TX) raised a point of order that amendment only requires a simple majority rather than 2/3. The point was ruled well taken, and the amendment was ruled adopted, making the Dixon version the main motion. The main motion as amended failed by a standing vote.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Mike Shipley (AZ) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider adding a new Convention Rule 6 which would specify that presidential debate participation would be open to any candidate who receives 30 nominating tokens. The suspension of the rules failed by a voice vote.

REMOVE UNNECESSARY ARTICLE 2: PERIOD OF DURATION

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 2: PERIOD OF DURATION

~~The duration of the Party shall be perpetual.~~

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a show of hands.

ELIMINATE NON-REGULAR CONVENTIONS FROM BYLAWS

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

1. Regular Conventions:

The Party shall hold a Regular Convention every two years, at a time and place selected by the National Committee. Regular Conventions shall be held sometime during the period of July of an odd-numbered year through August of an even-numbered year. All business required to be conducted at Regular Conventions shall be conducted at Regular Conventions only.

~~2. Non-Regular Conventions:~~

~~In any year which does not include a Regular Convention, a non-regular convention may be held at the discretion of the National Committee.~~

~~3.2. Delegates:~~

a. Delegates shall be required to be members of either the Party or an affiliate party. At all Regular Conventions delegates shall be those so accredited who have registered at the Convention. ~~At all Non-Regular Conventions, any person who wishes to attend may do so.~~

Proviso: This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted.

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a show of hands.

DELETE REDUNDANT ARTICLE 12.6.C

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 12: OTHER COMMITTEES

6. Committee Procedures

- a. A majority vote of those Committee members present is necessary for a "do pass" recommendation, and in the case of the Platform Committee, a majority must approve each specific plank separately.
- b. Four or more members of the Platform Committee may join together to issue a minority report regarding any plank reported to the floor of the Convention. Two or more members of the Bylaws and Rules Committee or of the Credentials Committee may join together to issue a minority report regarding their business.

- c. ~~A majority of the membership of each committee shall constitute a quorum.~~

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a show of hands.

DEFINE IN ADVANCE THE PARTY'S AGREEMENT WITH PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGN

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 15: PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGNS

3. Not less than six months prior to each Presidential Nominating Convention, the National Committee shall publish the contract specifying the terms by which the Party and the Presidential and Vice-presidential campaign shall assist and support each other. The Chair shall sign on behalf of the Party with each person who otherwise qualifies and desires to be our candidate. Only those persons who have signed prior to the close of nominations and are in compliance with the contract shall be recognized as candidates and be eligible to be nominated for President or Vice-President.

Proviso: This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted. (A sample agreement is appended to this report.)

Following debate, the motion failed by a show of hands. Pursuant to Convention Rule 4, the motion was opened for amendments.

Dana Cummings (FL) moved to amend the committee proposal by deleting everything following "The chair shall sign on behalf of the Party" so that the proposal would instead read:

ARTICLE 15: PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGNS

3. Not less than six months prior to each Presidential Nominating Convention, the National Committee shall publish the contract specifying the terms by which the Party and the Presidential and Vice-presidential campaign shall assist and support each other. The Chair shall sign on behalf of the Party.

Proviso: This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted. (A sample agreement is appended to this report.)

Aaron Starr (CA) moved to amend the Cummings amendment by striking "Not less than six months prior to each Presidential Nominating Convention, the National Committee shall publish" and inserting in its place "At the prior convention, the Convention shall approve and cause to be published" and retaining the language struck in the Cummings motion such that if adopted, the motion would be as follows:

ARTICLE 15: PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGNS

3. At the prior convention, the Convention shall approve and cause to be published the contract specifying the terms by which the Party and the Presidential and Vice-presidential campaign shall assist and support each other. The Chair shall sign on behalf of the Party with each person who otherwise qualifies and desires to be our candidate. Only those persons who have signed prior to the close of nominations and are in compliance with the contract shall be recognized as candidates and be eligible to be nominated for President or Vice-President.

Proviso: This amendment shall take effect upon the final adjournment of the convention at which it is adopted. (A sample agreement is appended to this report.)

Following debate, the Starr amendment failed by a show of hands. Following additional debate on the Cummings amendment, it failed by a show of hands. As no amendments had been adopted for the main motion which had already failed as originally proposed, the convention proceeded to the next proposal.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Pat Dixon (TX) moved to suspend the rules for 10 minutes to consider a bylaw amendment which would specifically authorize approval voting in Bylaws Article 16.1. The suspension of the rules failed by a show of hands.

RECOGNITION OF PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CANDIDATES

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 15: PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGNS

6. Before the Nominating Convention, no candidate for President or Vice-President may be recognized as such by the National Committee who does not qualify under Bylaw Article 15 or does not have the current support of 30 registered delegates from the last convention. Delegates shall submit statements of support (and revocation) in writing in a pre-approved format to the Secretary. No delegate may join in supporting more than one candidate for each office. Nothing in the above shall prevent any candidate who otherwise satisfies the Bylaws and Convention Rules from seeking the Party's nomination.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to LNC Vice-Chair Arvin Vohra. Following debate, the motion failed by a show of hands. Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel, and pursuant to Convention Rule 4 the proposal was opened for amendment.

Aaron Starr (CA) moved to postpone the main motion indefinitely. The postponement was adopted by a show of hands.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Will Tyler White (MI) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to propose an amendment to the previously adopted new Convention Rule 10 to insert the words "when the results of a written ballot vote are within a 2% margin" after the phrase "...the Secretary shall review the ballot tabulation for accuracy and cosign the delegation totals". The suspension failed by a show of hands.

RE-AUTHORIZE LNC ESTABLISHMENT OF DUES WITH A TWO-THIRDS VOTE

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 5: MEMBERSHIP

1. Members of the Party shall be those persons who have certified in writing that they oppose the initiation of force to achieve political or social goals.
2. The National Committee may offer life memberships, and must honor all prior and future life memberships.

3. ~~"Sustaining member" is any Party member who has given at least \$25 to the Party in the prior twelve months, or who is a life member.~~
4. ~~The National Committee may create other levels of membership and shall determine the contribution or dues levels for such memberships.~~
5. ~~Higher levels of contribution by or on behalf of a Party member qualify as sustaining member status for any provision of these Bylaws.~~
6. ~~Only sustaining members shall be counted for delegate apportionment and National Committee representation. Only sustaining members shall be eligible to hold National Party office or be a candidate for President or Vice President.~~

3. "Sustaining members" are members of the Party who:

- a. During the prior twelve months have donated, or have had donated on their behalf, an amount of at least \$25 prescribed by a two-thirds vote of the National Committee; or
- b. Are Life members.

ARTICLE 15: PRESIDENTIAL AND VICE-PRESIDENTIAL CAMPAIGNS

No candidate may be nominated for President or Vice-President who is ineligible under the United States Constitution, who has not expressed a willingness to accept the nomination of the Party, who served as a stand-in candidate during the current election cycle, or who is not a sustaining member of the Party. A stand-in is an individual who has agreed to be placed on a state affiliate's nomination petition prior to the selection of nominees by the Libertarian Party at Convention.

Proviso: The dues for a Sustaining Member shall remain at \$25 until and unless a change is adopted by a two-thirds vote of the National Committee.

Chris Maden (IL) moved to divide the question and consider Bylaw Article 5 changes separately from the Bylaw Article 15 change. A voice vote on division of the question was inconclusive; it was ruled adopted by a show of hands.

Following debate, the proposed changes to Bylaws Article 5 failed by a show of hands.

The proposed change to Bylaws Article 15 was ruled adopted by a show of hands. Division was demanded. The motion was then ruled adopted by a standing vote.

As the proposed changes to Bylaws Article 5 had failed, pursuant to Convention Rule 4 that divided proposal was opened for amendment.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra.

Chuck Moulton (VA) moved to amend the committee proposal to insert "and not more than \$100" after the phrase "at least \$25" in Article 5.3.a.

June Genis (TX) moved to amend the Moulton amendment to strike "and not more than \$100" and in its place insert "but not more than 10% between conventions".

Following debate, the Genis amendment failed by a show of hands.

Aaron Starr moved to amend so that Article 5.3.a would read as follows:

["During the prior twelve months have donated, or have had donated on their behalf, an amount of at least \\$40 : or"](#)

Following debate, the Starr amendment failed by a show of hands. The Moulton amendment failed by a show of hands. As no amendments had been adopted for the main motion which had already failed as originally proposed, the convention proceeded to the next proposal.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

George Phillies (MA) moved to suspend the rules for 2 minutes to consider a bylaw amendment regarding sustaining members. The suspension failed by a show of hands.

Starchild (CA) moved to suspend the rules to consider amendment of Article 12.2 to replace "The Bylaws and Rules Committee shall consist of 10 Party members appointed by the National Committee no later than 3 months before a regular convention." with "The Bylaws and Rules Committee shall consist of 10 Party members elected by the delegates at a Regular Convention by ranked choice voting." The suspension failed by a show of hands.

Without objection at 11:53 a.m., announcements were made, after which the convention adjourned for lunch at 12:00 noon.

Following lunch, the convention was called back to order at 2:30 p.m. on Friday, May 27, 2016.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 695 delegates and 53 alternates who are entitled to cast 733 votes. Quorum is 294.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requests from affiliates for additions to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Alexandra Coe – PA delegate
Joe Johnson – CO delegate
John Karr – PA delegate
Desarae Lindsey – OH alternate
James Lindsey – OH alternate
Brandon Navom – NH alternate
Kyle-Perre Nfr – IN alternate
Rhonda Phillips – NY alternate
Larry Schneck – NE alternate
Mike Shannon – ND delegate
Celicia Slafter – PA delegate

These additions were approved without objection.

BYLAWS AND RULES COMMITTEE REPORT (CONTINUED)

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

A delegate moved to suspend the rules for 10 minutes the purpose of discussing deleting Convention Rule 5.1, which establishes the token system for platform plank retention votes. The motion failed by a show of hands.

At 2:34 p.m. the convention resumed consideration of the Bylaws and Rules Committee report.

ELECT OFFICERS AT MID-TERM CONVENTIONS

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws and the convention special rules of order as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

1. Regular Conventions:

The Party shall hold a Regular Convention every two years, at a time and place selected by the National Committee. Regular Conventions shall be held sometime during the period of July of an odd-numbered year through August of an even-numbered year. All business required to be conducted at Regular Conventions shall be conducted at Regular Conventions only. The Regular Convention held between Presidential Nominating Conventions shall be a Mid-Term Convention.

ARTICLE 7: OFFICERS

1. The officers of the Party shall be:

Chair,
Vice-Chair,
Secretary, and
Treasurer.

All of these officers shall be elected ~~by a Regular~~ at a Mid-Term Convention of the Party, shall take office immediately upon the close of the Convention and shall serve thereafter until the final adjournment of the next ~~Regular-Mid-Term~~ Convention, or until removed from office. No person shall serve as an officer who is not a sustaining member of the Party.

ARTICLE 8: NATIONAL COMMITTEE

7. The National Committee shall appoint new officers and members-at-large if vacancies occur, such officers and members-at-large to complete the term of the office vacated, or until there is an intervening Regular Convention, at which time a special election will be conducted to fill the seat.

RULE 8: ELECTION OF OFFICERS AND NATIONAL COMMITTEE

5. If a petition requesting the removal of a named Party Officer is signed by ten percent of the credentialed delegates and submitted to the Secretary by the close of business of the first day of a Presidential Nominating Convention, a vote to remove that Party Officer from office shall be included in the Order of Business immediately prior to Election of Party Officers and At-large Members of the National Committee. Each petition shall name no more than one person.

Proviso: *The amendment shall take effect upon the close of the convention at which it is adopted.*

Following debate, the vote on the motion was inconclusive by a show of hands. A standing vote was also inconclusive. The motion failed with a counted vote, with 155 in favor and 159 opposed. Pursuant to Convention Rule 4, the committee proposal was opened for amendment.

John Wilford (TX) moved to amend the committee proposal to add to the end of proposed Rule 8.5, "Removal of the chair in presidential years requires a 2/3 vote."

Aaron Starr (CA) moved to instead amend the first sentence of proposed Rule 8.5 to strike “ten” and insert “five” so the sentence would read “If a petition requesting the removal of a named Party Officer is signed by five percent of the credentialed delegates...”

Following debate, the Starr amendment failed by a voice vote. The Wilford amendment failed by a voice vote. As no amendments had been adopted for the main motion which had already failed as originally proposed, the convention proceeded to the next proposal.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Starchild (CA) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider an additional amendment to the just-considered proposal to add “No person shall serve on the LNC for more than 2 consecutive terms.” The suspension failed by a voice vote.

ESTABLISH A PARTY MISSION STATEMENT

On behalf of the Bylaws and Rules Committee, Mr. Carling moved to amend the bylaws as follows:

ARTICLE 3: MISSION STATEMENT

Defend freedom and expand liberty in America by electing Libertarian candidates to public office.

Following debate, the motion failed by a show of hands.

It being 3:00 p.m., the orders of the day were for an Awards Committee presentation.

AWARDS COMMITTEE

Jim Lark, as Chair of the Awards Committee, introduced the presentation. Awards Committee members presented the following individual awards.

Tim Hagan presented the Samuel Adams Activism Award to Wendy Adams. Daniel Hayes presented the Thomas Paine Communication Award to Jason Scheurer. Roland Riemers presented the Patrick Henry Candidate Award to Will Hammer. Dr. Lark presented the Thomas Jefferson Leadership Award to BetteRose Ryan.

PLATFORM RETENTION VOTE

At 3:52 p.m. Ms. Mattson presented the counts of platform tokens. Pursuant to Convention Rule 5.1.g, with an updated count from the credentials database, it required tokens equal to 20% of 748, or 150 tokens, to bring a platform plank to a deletion vote.

The following numbers of tokens were received: (all unlisted planks received 0 tokens)

Plank	Title	Token Count
1.5	Abortion	439
4.0	Omissions	133
3.2	Internal Security and Individual Rights	27
2.4	Government Finance and Spending	23
3.4	Free Trade and Migration	23
2.3	Energy and Resources	15

2.2	Environment	14
2.10	Retirement and Income Security	14
2.8	Education	11
1.6	Crime and Justice	8
3.0	Securing Liberty	8
1.4	Personal Relationships	7
3.3	International Affairs	7
2.9	Health Care	6
1.1	Self-Ownership	5
3.6	Representative Government	4
1.7	Self-Defense	3
2.7	Labor Markets	3
1.2	Expression and Communication	2
3.7	Self Determination	2
2.5	Money and Financial Markets	1
3.5	Rights and Discrimination	1

Ms. Mattson noted that platform plank 1.5 Abortion had received a sufficient number of tokens to require a no-debate deletion vote.

Ted Brown (CA) moved to suspend the rules for 10 minutes to discuss a motion to delete Convention Rule 5.1, which establishes the token system for platform plank retention votes. Mr. Brown clarified the intent would be that once the rule was deleted, we would not proceed to a vote on deleting the Abortion plank. Aaron Starr (CA) raised a point of order that the same motion had already been raised and defeated earlier in the day.² Mr. Sarwark ruled the motion to be in order because it was more specific than the more general motion made earlier. The motion to suspend was ruled failed by a voice vote. Division was demanded. The suspension was ruled failed by a standing vote.

The convention took up the non-debatable motion to delete platform plank 1.5 Abortion, pursuant to Convention Rule 5.1.g. The motion failed by a standing vote. Division was demanded. The chair ruled the demand to be dilatory. The ruling of the chair was appealed. The ruling of the chair was sustained by a voice vote.

PLATFORM COMMITTEE REPORT

Alicia Mattson, as Chair of the Platform Committee, began presentation of the committee's report.

3.6 REPRESENTATIVE GOVERNMENT – CHANGE “ALLOWED” TO “FREE”

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 3.6 of the platform as follows:

3.6 Representative Government

We support election systems that are more representative of the electorate at the federal, state and local levels. As private voluntary groups, political parties should be ~~allowed~~ free to establish their own rules for nomination procedures, primaries and conventions. We call for an end to any tax-financed subsidies to candidates or parties and the repeal of all laws which restrict voluntary financing of election campaigns. We oppose laws that effectively exclude alternative candidates and parties, deny ballot access, gerrymander districts, or deny the voters their right to consider all legitimate alternatives. We advocate initiative, referendum, recall and repeal when used as popular checks on government.

The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

DELETE 2.3 ENERGY AND RESOURCES

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to delete plank 2.3 of the platform as follows:

2.3 Energy and Resources

~~While energy is needed to fuel a modern society, government should not be subsidizing any particular form of energy. We oppose all government control of energy pricing, allocation, and production.~~

Kevin Ludlow (TX) moved to suspend the rules to combine both committee proposals regarding plank 2.3 Energy and Resources into a single motion. The motion was adopted by a voice vote, amending the main motion to be as follows:

2.3 Energy and Resources

~~While energy is needed to fuel a modern society, government should not be subsidizing any particular form of energy. We oppose all government control of energy pricing, allocation, and production.~~

While energy is needed to fuel a modern society, government should not subsidize any particular form of energy. We oppose all government control of energy pricing, allocation, and production. Ethanol subsidies, in particular, have caused market misallocations that have led to higher food prices and demonstrate the tragic consequences of charging bureaucrats with the task of overruling the discipline of markets. Likewise, the use of military power to assure the supply of crude oil from foreign sources stifles innovation by US energy companies who would otherwise be driven to develop alternative energy supplies.

Following debate, the motion failed by a voice vote. Division was demanded. The chair ruled the demand to be dilatory.

Delegates indicated a desire to offer amendments. A vote on the required motion (per Convention Rule 5.3.b) to hear amendments was inconclusive by a voice vote. The motion failed by a standing vote, and the convention proceeded to the next proposal.

1.0 PERSONAL LIBERTY – CLARIFY ACCEPTING CONSEQUENCES IS AN OBLIGATION

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 1.0 of the platform as follows:

1.0 Personal Liberty

Individuals should be free to make choices for themselves and ~~to~~must accept responsibility for the consequences of the choices they make. Our support of an individual's right to make choices in life does not mean that we necessarily approve or disapprove of those choices. No individual, group, or government may initiate force against any other individual, group, or government.

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a voice vote.

MOVE LANGUAGE TO NEW 1.6 PARENTAL RIGHTS PLANK

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to create a new plank 1.6 by moving language from plank 3.5 as follows:

1.6 Parental Rights

Parents, or other guardians, have the right to raise their children according to their own standards and beliefs. This statement shall not be construed to condone child abuse or neglect.

3.5 Rights and Discrimination

Libertarians embrace the concept that all people are born with certain inherent rights. We reject the idea that a natural right can ever impose an obligation upon others to fulfill that "right." We condemn bigotry as irrational and repugnant. Government should neither deny nor abridge any individual's human right based upon sex, wealth, ethnicity, creed, age, national origin, personal habits, political preference or sexual orientation. Members of private organizations retain their rights to set whatever standards of association they deem appropriate, and individuals are free to respond with ostracism, boycotts and other free market solutions.

~~Parents, or other guardians, have the right to raise their children according to their own standards and beliefs. This statement shall not be construed to condone child abuse or neglect.~~

The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Trent Somes (PA) moved to suspend the rules in order to consider an amendment for the newly created Parental Rights plank. A voice vote on the suspension was inconclusive; the motion failed by a standing vote.

AMEND LANGUAGE MOVED TO NEW 1.6 PARENTAL RIGHTS PLANK

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend the newly-created plank 1.6 of the platform as follows:

1.6 Parental Rights and Responsibilities

~~Parents, or other guardians, have the right to raise their children according to their own standards and beliefs. This statement shall not be construed to condone child abuse or neglect.~~ Children do not begin life as fully autonomous beings capable of making rational decisions. Parents and guardians have a duty to provide for their children and develop them into adults. Their right to do so in accordance with their standards and beliefs should be legally respected, so long as they do not engage in abuse, neglect, or reckless endangerment.

Following debate, the motion was ruled failed on a standing vote. A standing count was requested, but there were not 20 delegates to order the standing count.

A delegate indicated a desire to offer an amendment. A vote on the required motion (per Convention Rule 5.3.b) to hear amendments was ruled failed by a voice vote. Division was demanded. The motion failed by a standing vote.

2.10 RETIREMENT AND INCOME SECURITY – INSERT “EVEN”

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 2.10 of the platform as follows:

2.10 Retirement and Income Security

Retirement planning is the responsibility of the individual, not the government. Libertarians would phase out the current government-sponsored Social Security system and transition to a private voluntary system. The proper and most effective source of help for the poor is the voluntary efforts of private groups and individuals. We believe members of society will become even more charitable and civil society will be strengthened as government reduces its activity in this realm.

After a delegate said debate on this motion was a waste of time and moved the previous question, another delegate raised a point of order that it wasn't in order to first debate the merits of calling the question and then call the question. Mr. Sarwark ruled that discussion of whether the proposal is a waste of time is in order during debate of the motion. Kurt Hildebrand (TX) raised a point of order that the time being spent for discussion of the point of order was itself dilatory.

Following the points of order, there was no objection to the previous question, and the main motion was adopted by a voice vote.

GENERAL CLEANUP OF 1.6 CRIME AND JUSTICE

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 1.6 of the platform as follows:

1.6 Crime and Justice

~~Government exists.~~ The prescribed role of government is to protect the rights of every individual, including the right to life, liberty and property. Criminal laws should be limited in their application to violations of the rights of others through force or fraud, or to deliberate actions that place others involuntarily at significant risk of harm. ~~We.~~ Therefore, we favor the repeal of all laws creating "crimes" without victims, such as the use of drugs for medicinal or recreational purposes, ~~since only actions that infringe on the rights of others can properly be termed crimes. Individuals retain the right to voluntarily assume risk of harm to themselves.~~ We support restitution to the victim to the fullest degree possible at the expense of the criminal or the negligent wrongdoer. ~~We oppose reduction of constitutional safeguards of the rights of the criminally accused.~~ The constitutional rights of the criminally accused, including due process, a speedy trial, legal counsel, trial by jury, and the legal presumption of innocence until proven guilty, must ~~not be denied~~ preserved. We assert the common-law right of juries to judge not only the facts but also the justice of the law.

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a standing vote.

NEW 2.8 GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES PLANK

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to adopt a new platform plank as follows:

2.5 Government Employees

We favor repealing any requirement that one must join or pay dues to a union as a condition of government employment. We advocate replacing defined-benefit pensions with defined-contribution plans, as are commonly offered in the private sector, so as not to impose debt on future generations without their consent.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra.

Following debate, the motion was adopted by a show of hands.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

A delegate moved to suspend the rules for 15 minutes to take up immediate consideration of the sequence of committee proposals to first delete and then rebuild the Abortion plank. The motion failed by a show of hands.

Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

REPHRASE “NEITHER PROFITS NOR LOSSES ARE SOCIALIZED” OF 2.5 MONEY AND FINANCIAL MARKETS

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 2.5 of the platform as follows:

2.5 Money and Financial Markets

We favor free-market banking, with unrestricted competition among banks and depository institutions of all types. Markets are not actually free unless fraud is vigorously combated ~~and neither profits nor losses are socialized.~~ Those who enjoy the possibility of profits must not impose risks of losses upon others, such as through government guarantees or bailouts. Individuals engaged in voluntary exchange should be free to use as money any mutually agreeable commodity or item. We support a halt to inflationary monetary policies and unconstitutional legal tender laws.

The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

DELETE 4.0 OMISSIONS

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to delete plank 4.0 of the platform as follows:

4.0 Omissions

~~Our silence about any other particular government law, regulation, ordinance, directive, edict, control, regulatory agency, activity, or machination should not be construed to imply approval.~~

Jim Fulner presented a minority report for this proposal (co-sponsored by Darryl Perry, Jim Fulner, Matt Cholko, and Dean Ahmad) which was as follows:

4.0 Omissions

Our silence about any other particular government law, regulation, ordinance, directive, edict, control, regulatory agency, activity, or machination, including the existence of any particular governmental system, should not be construed to imply approval. In every matter, we adhere to the consistent application of the principle of the non-initiation of physical force or fraud.

By a standing vote, the minority report was chosen to become the main motion, and the 15 minutes of debate on that main motion will be the first order of business tomorrow morning under the Platform Committee report agenda item.

Following announcements, the convention adjourned at 5:34 p.m. until 9:30 a.m. the following day.

VICE-PRESIDENTIAL DEBATE QUALIFICATION TOKENS

The Convention Oversight Committee had established that any vice-presidential candidate who received a number of vice-presidential nomination tokens equal to 10% of the credentials report as of Friday morning would be eligible to participate in the vice-presidential debate Friday evening. Based on the morning Credentials Committee report total of 481, candidates needed to receive 49 tokens to qualify for debate participation. The deadline for submission of these tokens was the Friday evening adjournment.

Immediately upon Friday adjournment, the tellers counted the vice-presidential tokens and announced the results post-adjournment as follows:

Candidate	Vice-Presidential Debate Inclusion Token Count
William Weld	126
Larry Sharpe	125
Alicia Dearn	89
Will Coley	51
Kerry McKennon	22
Mark Stewart	20
Judd Weiss	17
Derek Grayson	15
Jeff Mortenson	12
Doug Craig	8
Austin Petersen	5
Marc Allen Feldman	2
Several miscellaneous others	1 each

Since 49 tokens were required to qualify for the debate, the qualifying candidates were William Weld, Larry Sharpe, Alicia Dearn, and Will Coley.

DAY 2 – CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

The convention was called back to order at 9:40 a.m. on Saturday, May 28, 2016.

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 795 delegates and 65 alternates who are entitled to cast 836 votes. Quorum is 335.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested changes to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Moving from one delegation to another:

Joe Buchman – moving from UT alternate to PA delegate
Anna Buchman – moving from UT alternate to PA alternate

Additions to the list:

Richard Burke – ND alternate
Stephen Griffin – NC alternate
Greg Burnett – ND alternate
Tim Reeves – ND alternate

Jacob Hickey – OH alternate
Emilie Petri – OH alternate
Anthony Federici – PA delegate
Matt Hasty – PA delegate
Katherine Lachine – PA delegate
Anna Womack – PA delegate
Scott Womack – PA delegate
Marshall Bradlee – WI delegate
Maureen Freeman – WI delegate
Leslie Marshall – WI delegate
Ben Olson – WI delegate

A motion to approve these changes to the list was adopted with a voice vote.

INTERIM TOKEN COUNTS

Ken Moellman (OH) moved to suspend the rules and direct the secretary to provide interim token counts for President and Vice-President. A show of hands vote was inconclusive. A standing vote was ruled to have achieved the required two-thirds threshold. Aaron Starr (CA) requested a counted vote, and the chair agreed to order one. The motion failed by a counted vote which found 150 in favor and 150 opposed.

A delegate raised a point of order to ask if a quorum was present, given that the counts on that vote only added up to 300 votes, not the 335 required for quorum. Mr. Sarwark issued no ruling.³

Rich Tomasso (NH) moved to suspend the rules to direct the secretary at her convenience to not identify complete token counts, but only to identify which candidates have received the 30 tokens required to be nominated. Kevin Ludlow (TX) raised point of order that the assembly just voted on a question which would have the same effect on delegate behavior, and it had failed.² Mr. Sarwark ruled that the Tomasso motion was a substantially different question, thus was in order.

Joe Buchman (PA) raised a point of order that during the counted vote, new people were entering the room, which gave the “no” voters more time than the “yes” voters to bring in extra votes, and we should close the doors and not allow delegates to enter during a vote. Mr. Sarwark initially ruled against the point of order, but then found the point was well taken.⁴ Mr. Sarwark noted that our custom was to allow floor whips to round up delegates during the vote.⁵

The Tomasso motion had not yet been stated by the chair, and Mr. Tomasso withdrew the motion.

PRESIDENTIAL DEBATE QUALIFICATION

The Convention Oversight Committee had established that any presidential candidate who received a number of presidential nomination tokens equal to 10% of the credentials report as of Saturday morning would be eligible to participate in the presidential debate Saturday evening.

Mr. Sarwark requested of a Credentials Committee member how many names had been approved to be added during the credentials report, and he was told 22 were added to the original 836. Mr. Sarwark indicated that 10% of $(836 + 22 = 858)$ meant that 86 tokens would be required for participation in the presidential debate.

PREVIEW OF NEW WEBSITE

Kevin Ludlow (TX) demonstrated to the delegates a preview of the new website which is in the final stages of development.

PLATFORM COMMITTEE REPORT (CONTINUED)

Following a number of requests for information, at 10:17 a.m. the convention resumed where it left off the previous day, considering the minority report for an amendment to the Omissions platform plank which had become the main motion. The main motion was as follows:

4.0 Omissions

Our silence about any other particular government law, regulation, ordinance, directive, edict, control, regulatory agency, activity, or machination, including the existence of any particular governmental system, should not be construed to imply approval. In every matter, we adhere to the consistent application of the principle of the non-initiation of physical force or fraud.

Following debate, the motion failed by a standing vote.

A delegate indicated a desire to offer an amendment to the failed proposal. A vote on the required motion (per Convention Rule 5.3.b) to hear amendments failed by a show of hands.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Aaron Starr (CA) moved to suspend the rules to take up a motion to replace the entirety of existing language in platform plank 1.5 Abortion with both sentences shown in Platform Committee proposal 9B ("Taxpayers should not be forced to pay for other people's abortions. Moreover, we advocate eliminating regulations that prohibit over-the-counter sales of contraceptives, which prevent unwanted pregnancies.") and not consider Platform Committee proposals 9, 9A, 9C, or 9D on the same subject. The motion to suspend the rules was ruled adopted by a show of hands. Division was demanded, and the motion was ruled adopted by a standing vote. A counted vote was ordered. The motion failed by a standing count with a total of 194 in favor and 169 opposed.

Brett Larson (GA) moved to postpone indefinitely Platform Committee proposals 9, 9A, 9B, 9C, and 9D, all related to plank 1.5 Abortion. Mr. Sarwark noted this requires a suspension of the rules, as our rules prescribe that the convention consider the committee proposals. The motion was adopted by a standing vote.

Barbara Howe (NC) moved to set a deadline for submission of vice-presidential tokens for purposes of qualifying for the nomination to be 20 minutes after the conclusion of the presidential nomination. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

REWRITE 2.2 ENVIRONMENT

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Ms. Mattson moved to amend plank 2.2 of the platform as follows:

2.2 Environment

~~We support a clean and healthy environment and sensible use of our natural resources. Private landowners and conservation groups have a vested interest in maintaining natural resources. Pollution and misuse of resources cause damage to our ecosystem. Governments, unlike private businesses, are unaccountable for such damage done to our environment and have a terrible track record when it comes to environmental protection. Protecting the environment requires a clear definition and enforcement of individual rights in resources like land, water, air, and wildlife. Free markets and property rights stimulate the technological innovations and behavioral changes required to protect our environment and ecosystems. We realize that our planet's climate is constantly~~

~~changing, but environmental advocates and social pressure are the most effective means of changing public behavior.~~ Individual rights are pointless without a clean, healthy environment capable of sustaining human life. Competitive free markets and property rights stimulate the technological innovations and behavioral changes required to protect our environment and ecosystems. Private landowners and conservation groups have a vested interest in maintaining natural resources. Governments are unaccountable for damage done to our environment and have a terrible track record when it comes to environmental protection. Protecting the environment requires a clear definition and enforcement of individual rights and responsibilities regarding resources like land, water, air, and wildlife. Where damages can be proven and quantified in a court of law, restitution to the injured parties must be required.

Following debate, the motion failed by a voice vote. There was interest in offering amendments. A vote on the required motion (per Convention Rule 5.3.b) to hear amendments was adopted by a voice vote.

Kathie Glass (TX) moved to amend the proposal by deleting from the inserted language the sentence "Individual rights are pointless without a clean, healthy environment capable of sustaining human life." Following debate, the amendment was adopted by a voice vote, so the main motion became as follows:

2.2 Environment

~~We support a clean and healthy environment and sensible use of our natural resources. Private landowners and conservation groups have a vested interest in maintaining natural resources. Pollution and misuse of resources cause damage to our ecosystem. Governments, unlike private businesses, are unaccountable for such damage done to our environment and have a terrible track record when it comes to environmental protection. Protecting the environment requires a clear definition and enforcement of individual rights in resources like land, water, air, and wildlife. Free markets and property rights stimulate the technological innovations and behavioral changes required to protect our environment and ecosystems. We realize that our planet's climate is constantly changing, but environmental advocates and social pressure are the most effective means of changing public behavior.~~ Competitive free markets and property rights stimulate the technological innovations and behavioral changes required to protect our environment and ecosystems. Private landowners and conservation groups have a vested interest in maintaining natural resources. Governments are unaccountable for damage done to our environment and have a terrible track record when it comes to environmental protection. Protecting the environment requires a clear definition and enforcement of individual rights and responsibilities regarding resources like land, water, air, and wildlife. Where damages can be proven and quantified in a court of law, restitution to the injured parties must be required.

The main motion as amended was adopted by a standing vote.

Dean Ahmad (MD) moved to suspend the rules to consider adding a new first sentence to the Environment plank as just amended. The new sentence would read, "A clean, healthy environment capable of supporting human life is a pre-requisite for a society that defends individual rights." The suspension failed by a voice vote.

Scotty Boman (MI) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider adding a new first sentence to the Environment plank as just amended. The new sentence would read, "Individual rights are enhanced by a clean, healthy environment capable of sustaining human life." A voice vote on the suspension was inconclusive. The suspension failed by a standing vote.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra.

NEW 1.7 DEATH PENALTY PLANK

On behalf of the Platform Committee, Dean Ahmad moved to adopt a new platform plank as follows:

1.7 Death Penalty

The death penalty is irreversible and no recompense can be made for an execution later found to be in error. Since 1973 there have been more than 155 exonerations of individuals wrongfully sentenced to death in the United States. Further, the death penalty is not fairly and uniformly applied, but disproportionately imposed based on the race of the victim. Given the fallibility of any judicial system, punishments that cannot be reversed or compensated for should not be levied. Apart from differences reasonable people may have as to the morality of the death penalty, the government's record in unfair execution of innocents requires an indefinite suspension of the death penalty.

Aaron Starr presented a minority report for this proposal (co-sponsored by Aaron Starr, Debbie Schum, Guy McLendon, and M Carling) which was as follows:

1.7 Death Penalty

We seek a world where no individual initiates aggression against another. Murder is the unlawful premeditated killing of one human being by another, and is the ultimate aggression, a depriving of the most basic right – the right to life. With appropriate safeguards, due process and a system of appeals, the death penalty is a morally appropriate option for juries to impose on those who demonstrate such disregard for human life.

Following debate, by a standing vote the committee report was chosen to become the main motion.

A motion to close debate on the main motion was ruled adopted by a show of hands. Division was demanded. Mr. Vohra ruled that debate was already closed, therefore it was not in order to call for division. Alicia Mattson (CA) raised point of order that the announcement of the result of the vote is precisely when division is to be requested.⁶ Mr. Vohra ruled the point well taken. The motion to close debate was then ruled adopted on a standing vote.

The main motion was ruled failed on a standing vote. A counted vote was ordered by 20 or more delegates.

A delegate requested a quorum call. Mr. Vohra ruled the quorum call to be dilatory. The ruling of the chair was appealed. On a standing vote, the ruling of the chair was sustained, and the counted vote was taken on the motion to add the Death Penalty plank. The motion to add the new plank failed to achieve the required two-thirds, with a counted vote total of 271 in favor and 154 opposed.

There was interest in offering amendments. A vote on the required motion (per Convention Rule 5.3.b) to hear amendments was adopted by a show of hands.

Whitney Bilyeu (TX) moved to amend the committee proposal as follows:

1.7 Death Penalty

~~The death penalty is irreversible and no recompense can be made for an execution later found to be in error. Since 1973 there have been more than 155 exonerations of individuals wrongfully sentenced to death in the United States. Further, the death penalty is not fairly and uniformly applied, but disproportionately imposed based on the race of the victim. Given the fallibility of any judicial system, punishments that cannot be reversed or compensated for should not be levied. Apart from differences reasonable people may have as to the morality of the death penalty, the government's record in unfair execution of innocents requires an indefinite suspension of the death penalty.~~

We oppose the administration of the death penalty by the state.

Following debate, the amendment was adopted by a show of hands, making the main motion to add a new platform plank as follows:

1.7 Death Penalty

We oppose the administration of the death penalty by the state.

Following debate, by a standing vote the main motion vote was ruled to have passed. A counted vote was ordered by at least 20 delegates. The motion was adopted by a counted vote total of 364 in favor and 105 opposed.

Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

HISTORICAL AUDIO RECORDINGS

Without objection, D. Frank Robinson was introduced for a presentation of digitized audio recordings of the Libertarian Party conventions in 1972 (Denver) and 1974 (Dallas) for preservation in party archives.

Without objection, at 12:15 p.m. the convention adjourned for lunch until 2:30 p.m.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

Following lunch, the convention was called back to order at 2:30 p.m. on Saturday, May 28, 2016.

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 857 delegates and 79 alternates who are entitled to cast 891 votes. Quorum is 357.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested changes to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Moving from one delegation to another:

Michelle Gregoire – moving from MI alternate to ND alternate
Terry Bending – moving from AK alternate to ND alternate

Additions to the list:

Robert Griffis – CA alternate
Derrick Michael Reid – CA alternate
John Stagliano – CA alternate
Joshua Curtis – FL alternate
Michael Huff – FL alternate
Pamela Jensen – FL alternate
Edward Toppe – FL alternate
Tatiana Moroz – NJ delegate
Thelma Ij Okoli – PA alternate
Scott Scrimshaw – WA delegate
W. Bruce DelValle – WI delegate
Trent Poole – WI delegate
Jason Scheurer – WI delegate

Steven LaBianca – WY alternate

The motion to approve the changes was adopted by a voice vote.

AWARDS COMMITTEE

Jim Lark, as Chair of the Awards Committee, introduced the members of the committee and described the Hall of Liberty Award. Committee members presented the following individual awards.

Daniel Hayes and Roland Reimers announced Ron Paul as an inductee into the Hall of Liberty. Dr. Paul wasn't able to attend the convention, but he accepted the honor via a pre-recorded video which was played for the convention. Guy McLendon accepted the award on behalf of Ron Paul.

Dr. Lark and Tim Hagan announced Bill Redpath as an inductee into the Hall of Liberty. A video of Mr. Redpath was played for the convention before Mr. Redpath accepted the award in person from Richard Winger.

PRESIDENTIAL NOMINATION

While the teller team finished counting presidential nomination tokens, Jim Fulner (MI) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to modify Convention Rule 7 by adding a new Section 6 which would read, "Participation in any Party sponsored presidential candidate debate at the National Convention shall be open to all presidential candidates who receive enough presidential nomination tokens to be entered into nomination in accordance with Rule 7 Section 1." The motion to suspend the rules failed by a show of hands.

At 3:07 p.m., based on the token counts, the candidates so far eligible for nomination for President were: Gary Johnson, Austin Petersen, Darryl Perry, John McAfee, Marc Allan Feldman, and Kevin McCormick, each having received at least 30 tokens.

Those so far eligible for Saturday night's presidential debate were: Gary Johnson, Austin Petersen, Darryl Perry, and John McAfee, each having received 86 or more tokens.

The order of nominating speeches was randomized with the secretary's 20-sided die.

Mr. Sarwark indicated his understanding that nominations do not close until the end of the nominating speeches, thus if it was desired to close the nominations and stop accepting tokens at this time, it would require a suspension of the rules. A motion to suspend the rules and close nominations for President failed by a show of hands, thus tokens were still permitted to be submitted during the presidential nominating speeches.

Nominating speeches for John McAfee were given by: an unidentified speaker and John McAfee.

Nominating speeches for Gary Johnson were given by: Bill Redpath (VA), Steve Kerbel (CO), and Gary Johnson.

Nominating speeches for Marc Allan Feldman were given by: Paul Stanton (FL), Gary Johnson (NM), Jim Fulner (MI), Keyon Grayson (FL), and Marc Allan Feldman.

Nominating speeches for Austin Petersen were given by: Sean Haugh (NC), Stewart Flood (SC), and Austin Petersen.

Nominating speeches for Darryl Perry were given by: Kim Ruff (NY), Caryn Ann Harlos (CO), and Starchild (CA).

A nominating speech for Kevin McCormick was given by Kevin McCormick.

During the nominating speeches, Marc Allan Feldman secured enough additional tokens to also qualify for the presidential debate.

A motion to close nominations was adopted by a voice vote. The final token counts at the close of nominations were as follows:

Candidate	Presidential Token Count
Gary Johnson	226
Austin Petersen	106
Darryl Perry	105
John McAfee	97
Marc Allan Feldman	89
Kevin McCormick	45
Mike Shannon	23
Vermin Supreme	20
Heidi Zeman	8
Shawna Sterling	5
Jack Robinson	5
Derrick Michael Reid	4
J.D. Donahe	3
Alicia Dearn	1
Robert Griffis	1
Jacob Hornberger	1
Rhett Smith	1
Spoiled tokens	7

Without objection at 4:48 p.m. the convention adjourned until the following day.

DAY 3 - CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

The convention was called back to order at 9:45 a.m. on Sunday, May 29, 2016.

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 911 delegates and 76 alternates who are entitled to cast 931 votes. Quorum is 373.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested additions to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Chad Carleton – MO delegate
Emily Church – MO alternate
Ashley Lewandowski – KS delegate
Marcus Lopez – NV delegate

A motion to approve the additions was adopted by a voice vote.

PRESIDENTIAL NOMINATION (CONTINUED)

Ballots for the first round of voting for President were distributed at 10:02 a.m.

During voting, Rachel Mills (NC) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider a resolution. Mr. Sarwark ruled it out of order during a vote. Starchild (CA) raised a point of order that it is always in order to suspend the rules. Mr. Sarwark ruled the point not well taken, as a vote was underway.⁷

During balloting three different delegates at different times raised points of order asserting that None of the Above (NOTA) is required to be printed on the ballots, but it had not been. Upon inquiry, the secretary explained to the chair that NOTA was not nominated, that only nominated candidates were printed, that Bylaws Article 11.8 merely provides that votes for NOTA are valid but has no requirement for it to be printed on the ballot, and the ballots had spaces for write-in votes. Mr. Sarwark ruled that it was an error on the ballot to be corrected on future ballots.

At 11:16 a.m. delegation chairs were asked to line up for the affiliate roll call reporting of the votes pursuant to Convention Rule 7.3, starting with the randomly selected District of Columbia. The affiliate roll call vote reporting concluded at 11:52 a.m., and the results of the first ballot for President were as follows:

President – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Gary Johnson	458	49.514%
Austin Petersen	197	21.297%
John McAfee	131	14.162%
Darryl Perry	63	6.811%
Marc Allan Feldman	58	6.270%
Kevin McCormick	9	0.973%
NOTA (write-in)	5	0.541%
Derrick Grayson (write-in)	1	0.108%
Ron Paul (write-in)	1	0.108%
Vermin Supreme (write-in)	1	0.108%
Heidi Zemen (write-in)	1	0.108%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Since no candidate attained a majority of the 925 ballots cast, pursuant to Convention Rule 7.2, Kevin McCormick as the candidate with the fewest votes was dropped from the ballot for the second ballot.

Jim Fulner (MI) moved to allow 2 minutes for Kevin McCormick to address the body. The motion was adopted by a voice vote, and Mr. McCormick addressed the assembly.

A delegate moved to suspend the rules and allow all tokens cast for presidential nomination to be counted towards a vice-presidential nomination for the same candidate. A voice vote on the suspension was inconclusive. The motion failed by a show of hands.

Ballots for the second round of voting for President were distributed at 12:07 p.m.

During voting, Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra, and Mr. Sarwark later resumed the gavel again.

During voting, at 12:39 p.m. Ms. Salvette was recognized to provide an updated Credentials Committee report. Following a motion by Ms. Salvette to accept the revised roll and to add new names to the list of those eligible to register, a delegate raised a point of order that other business is not allowed while we're voting on another question. Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel and ruled the point well taken⁷, and indicated the motion will be in order after completion of the vote in-progress.

Upon parliamentary inquiry from Chris Maden (IL), Mr. Sarwark indicated that it would be in order during the vote to move to suspend the rules to dispense with the Convention Rule 7.3 state-by-state roll call for the second ballot of president. Mr. Maden made such a motion, which was adopted by a voice vote. Darryl Perry

(NH) raised point of order that since the assembly was still in the middle of a vote, the motion should have been ruled out of order. Mr. Sarwark ruled that it was in order. Mr. Perry appealed the ruling of the chair. The ruling of the chair was sustained by a voice vote.

All delegations had submitted their totals by 12:46 p.m., but the grand totals had not yet been tabulated. A delegate who arrived late requested to be able to vote. John Wilford (TX) raised a point of order that voting isn't complete until the results are announced, thus the person should be allowed to vote. Mr. Sarwark ruled that voting is over.⁸

Rachel Mills (NC) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider the following resolution:

"For jointly guaranteeing an unprecedented wave of interest in political alternatives;
For arguably doing more to disentangle voters from deeply-held, long-standing political loyalties than we ever could on our own;
For opening minds to seek out new ideas of governance,
The Libertarian Party awards jointly Donald Trump and Hillary Clinton a Liberty Outreach Award."

The motion to suspend the rules was adopted by a voice vote. The resolution was adopted by a voice vote.

Mark Hinkle (CA) moved to suspend the rules to consider the following resolution:

"The delegates at the Libertarian Party 2016 convention wish to thank Vicki Kirkland for her efforts to bring this convention to Orlando, Florida. We wish her a speedy recovery from her recent illness."

There was no objection to suspending the rules. The resolution was adopted with a voice vote and no opposition.

The results of the second ballot for the presidential nomination were ready at 12:52 p.m. Following an on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results were announced at 12:56 p.m. as follows:

President – Ballot 2

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Gary Johnson	518	55.819%
Austin Petersen	203	21.875%
John McAfee	131	14.116%
Darryl Perry	52	5.603%
Marc Allan Feldman	18	1.940%
NOTA (write-in)	2	0.216%
Derrick Grayson (write-in)	1	0.108%
Kevin McCormick (write-in)	1	0.108%
Michael Shannon (write-in)	1	0.108%
Rhett Smith (write-in)	1	0.108%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 928 ballots cast, Gary Johnson was elected as the 2016 Libertarian Party nominee for President.

Pursuant to a motion previously adopted by the convention, vice-presidential nomination tokens became due at 1:16 p.m. (20 minutes after the conclusion of the presidential nomination)

Brett Larson (GA) moved to suspend the rules and allow any nominated presidential candidate to place their name into nomination for vice-president. Aaron Starr (CA) raised a point of order that the delegates had already voted a similar motion down.² Mr. Sarwark ruled that the motion was in order since circumstances have

changed and it's customarily done at our conventions. Daniel Hayes (LA) raised a point of order that such a motion would effectively permit some delegates to cast two tokens on the vice-presidential nomination.⁹ Mr. Sarwark ruled the motion was in order. A voice vote on the suspension was inconclusive. The motion failed by a standing vote.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

Ms. Salvette was recognized to give a new credentials report update, as it had been ruled as out of order during the vote.

Ms. Salvette reported registration totals being 920 delegates and 86 alternates who are entitled to cast 946 votes. Quorum is 379.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested additions to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Jessica Belle - NV delegate
Dianne Chalmers - WY alternate
Alice Lillie - CA alternate
Donald Meinshausen - NY delegate
Christina Sirois - WY alternate
Fred Stitt - CA alternate
Aaron Wennhold - NY delegate
Nick Zsidisin - ND alternate

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention, and that the new names for the list of those eligible to register be approved. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ben Bachrach (ND) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to consider the motion, "At any convention session previously published in the agenda to elect officers, LNC members, or Judicial Committee members the normal quorum requirement is waived." The motion was ruled out of order because it attempts to suspend a bylaw, and quorum cannot be suspended even with a unanimous vote.¹⁰

Gary Johnson gave an acceptance speech and advocated for Bill Weld to be the nominee for Vice-President.

The deadline for submission of vice-presidential nomination tokens was at 1:16 p.m.

At 1:20 p.m. the convention adjourned for lunch until 2:05 p.m.

After lunch, the convention was called back to order at 2:05 p.m. on Sunday, May 29, 2016.

PRESIDENTIAL CONCESSION SPEECHES

Jeffrey Carson (VA) moved to suspend the rules to allow each of the nominated presidential candidates who did not win the nomination to give a 2-minute concession speech. Mr. Sarwark ruled the motion adopted by a show of hands. Division was demanded. The motion was adopted by a standing vote.

A delegate moved to suspend the rules and display a website link on the screen. Mr. Sarwark ruled it out of order.

Concession speeches were delivered by: Marc Allan Feldman, Austin Petersen (endorsed Alicia Dearn for Vice-President), John McAfee (endorsed Derrick Grayson for Vice-President), and Darryl Perry (advocated for either Will Coley or Larry Sharpe for Vice-President).

VICE-PRESIDENTIAL TOKEN COUNTS

The token counts for vice-presidential nominations were as follows:

Candidate	Vice-Presidential Token Count
William Weld	192
Larry Sharpe	161
Alicia Dearn	104
Will Coley	61
Judd Weiss	46
Derrick Grayson	33
Kerry McKennon	25
Mark Stewart	22
Austin Petersen	17
Jeff Mortenson	12
Marc Allan Feldman	9
Doug Craig	8
John McAfee	6
Gary Johnson	2
Darryl Perry	2
Dean Ahmad	1
Thomas Aaron Bailey	1
Daniel Hogan	1
Tony Jones	1
Steve Kerbel	1
Kevin McCormick	1
Rhett Smith	1
Paul Weiss	1
Wells	1
Spoiled tokens	5

Those eligible to be nominated for Vice-President were: William Weld, Larry Sharpe, Alicia Dearn, Will Coley, Judd Weiss, and Derrick Grayson, each having received 30 or more tokens.

VICE-PRESIDENTIAL NOMINATION

The order of nominating speeches was randomized with the secretary's 20-sided die.

Nominating speeches for William Weld were given by: Jim Gray (CA), Marc Allan Feldman (OH), and William Weld.

Judd Weiss used his nomination speech time to withdraw from the race and endorse Will Coley.

Sam Sloan (CA) raised a point of order that Mr. Weiss was granted time for a nomination speech, but instead Mr. Weiss said at the beginning of his time that he was withdrawing and endorsed someone else. During subsequent comments from Mr. Sloan, Alicia Mattson (CA) raised a point of order that Mr. Sloan was violating decorum rules by making a personal attack on M Carling. The chair ruled the point well taken and instructed Mr. Sloan to refrain from personal attacks. Mr. Sloan indicated his point of order was that he objected to Mr. Carling assisting the secretary during the convention, though he cited no alleged rule violation. Mr. Sarwark put a motion to allow Mr. Carling to continue to sit on the stage and assist the secretary. The motion was adopted by voice vote.

Nominating speeches for Derrick Grayson were given by: Jonathan Mandell (CT) and Derrick Grayson.

A Nominating speech for Alicia Dearn was given by Alicia Dearn.

Nominating speeches for Larry Sharpe were given by: Steven Nielsen (WA), John Wilford (TX), and Larry Sharpe.

Nominating speeches for Will Coley were given by: Caryn Ann Harlos (CO), Hesham El-Meligy (NY), Steve Sheetz (PA), and Will Coley.

Nominations for Vice-President were closed at 3:34 pm.

Per Convention Rule 7.4, Gary Johnson was given 5 minutes to speak, and he asked the delegates to nominate Bill Weld for Vice-President.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

At 3:49 p.m. Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 898 delegates and 86 alternates who are entitled to cast 928 votes. Quorum is 372.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested changes to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Change: Mike Vaccarino – move from FL alternate to KY alternate

Addition: Michael Moran – IN alternate

A motion to approve the changes was adopted by a voice vote.

VICE-PRESIDENTIAL NOMINATION (CONTINUED) -- LNC CHAIR NOMINATION

Timothy Perkins (CA) moved to suspend the rules and dispense with the Convention Rule 7.3 state-by-state roll call announcement of votes by delegation chairs. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

Ballots for the first round of voting for Vice-President were distributed at 3:50 p.m.

Geoffrey Neale (CA) raised a point of order that the previous voice vote for the Perkins motion was just to suspend the rules, so the convention should next vote on the motion to dispense with the roll call. Mr. Sarwark ruled that it was in order to process them as a single motion.¹¹

There was no objection from the assembly for Mr. Sarwark's request to have Jim Lark to serve as chair pro tem during the later elections of LNC Chair and LNC Vice-Chair.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra briefly and then resumed the role.

The results of the second ballot for the vice-presidential nomination were ready at 4:36 p.m. Following an on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results were announced at 4:40 p.m. as follows:

Vice-President – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
William Weld	426	49.022%
Larry Sharpe	264	30.380%

Will Coley	93	10.702%
Derrick Grayson	48	5.524%
Alicia Dearn	29	3.337%
NOTA (write-in)	6	0.690%
Daniel Hogan (write-in)	1	0.115%
Gary Johnson (write-in)	1	0.115%
Austin Petersen (write-in)	1	0.115%

The secretary reported that there were also write-in votes for 4 ineligible candidates (see details in the appendices).

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Since no candidate attained a majority of the 869 ballots cast, pursuant to Convention Rule 7.2, Alicia Dearn as the candidate with the fewest votes was dropped from the ballot for the second round.

A delegate moved to suspend the rules for the second vice-presidential ballot to require that delegation chairs must return their totals within 20 minutes. Mr. Sarwark ruled it out of order because it would interfere with the fairness of the voting.

Steve Scheetz (PA) moved to suspend the rules and allow Will Coley to speak for 2 minutes to withdraw from the vice-presidential election, and to allow Alicia Dearn 2 minutes for a concession speech. The motion was adopted with a voice vote.

George Phillies (MA) moved to suspend the rules and allow nomination speeches for LNC Chair and LNC Vice-Chair to take place during the tabulation for the second vice-presidential ballot. The motion was adopted by a voice vote. Kurt Hildebrand (TX) raised a point of order that the vote just taken only suspended the rules, and we should now have debate on the motion before voting on it. Mr. Sarwark ruled it was in order to do it with one vote, since the motion to suspend also specified exactly how the rules would change.¹¹

Phil McMillan (NY) raised point of order that delegates were blocking the aisles, and the noise and congestion was interfering with other delegates' ability to participate in elections. Mr. Sarwark asked for aisles to be cleared.¹²

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Dr. Lark as chair pro tem.

Will Coley addressed the assembly to withdraw from the vice-presidential election, and he endorsed Larry Sharpe. Alicia Dearn was not present to take advantage of her allocated speaking time.

After the secretary re-printed ballots to remove Will Coley, the second ballot for Vice-President was distributed at 4:55 p.m.

Kurt Hildebrand (TX) raised a point of order that other business is not allowed during a vote, and it is difficult to organize a large delegation such as Texas to have a proper vote while there were ongoing nominating speeches for other offices.^{7 12} Dr. Lark ruled that the delegates had voted to suspend the rules, thus the nomination speeches were in order.

Steve Sheetz (PA) moved to suspend the rules to seat D. Frank Robinson as a new delegate from PA.

William McMillan (NY) raised a point of order that that several times the chair has asked for order, but the room is still problematically noisy for hearing speakers and voting.¹²

Tom Glass (TX) raised point of order that the Sheetz motion should be out of order during voting.⁷

Dr. Lark again requested order in the hall, due to excessive noise.¹²

Geoff Neale (TX) raised a point of order that it is not in order to receive credentialing reports from anyone but the Credentials Committee after they have first checked the person's eligibility. Dr. Lark ruled the point well taken and recognized Ms. Salvette, as Chair of the Credentials Committee. She reported the Credentials Committee has found D. Frank Robinson eligible, and moved that he be added to the roll of voting delegates for the convention. A point of order was raised from the GA delegation that a vote is underway, so other business is not in order until the conclusion of the vote.⁷ Dr. Lark ruled the point well taken, thus the Salvette and Sheetz motions were out of order during voting.

Dr. Lark again called for order and requested that delegates reduce the noise in the hall.¹²

Since Alicia Dearn had returned to the hall to use her previously-granted 2 minutes to speak, and since the LNC officer nominating speeches had not yet begun, Dr. Lark returned the gavel to Mr. Sarwark. Mr. Sarwark ordered delegates to clear the aisles.¹²

Nate Benson (CO) moved to suspend the rules to cancel the second vice-presidential ballot underway because Derrick Grayson wished to drop out of the race. Mr. Sarwark ruled the motion out of order.⁷

Ms. Dearn was recognized to speak and endorsed William Weld for Vice-President.

Mr. Sarwark announced to the delegates that Derrick Grayson had withdrawn from the vice-presidential election, though voting is already underway with his name on the ballot. There was no objection from the body for allowing Mr. Grayson to address body for 2 minutes. Mr. Grayson spoke to delegates and endorsed Larry Sharpe for Vice-President.

The delegates had agreed to allow nomination speeches during the ongoing vote, but no one had yet been nominated. Since conduct of business is not permitted during the vote, Mr. Sarwark indicated he would allow delegates to offer points of information about whom they intended to nominate in order to accomplish the goal.

Steve Nielson (WA) announced an intention to nominate Nicholas Sarwark.

Tim McGuire (IN) announced an intention to nominate Mark Rutherford.

Will Alisberg (NM) announced an intention to nominate Brett Pojunis.

Roger Young (CA) announced an intention to nominate James Weeks.

A delegate announced an intention to nominate Austin Petersen, but Mr. Petersen respectfully declined the nomination.

Mr. Sarwark put a motion to proceed with LNC Chair nomination speeches at this time, though not all states had yet returned their second vice-presidential ballot, thus voting was still underway. The motion was adopted with a voice vote. A random speaking order was established with the secretary's 20-sided die.

Mr. Sarwark passed the gavel to Jim Lark to serve as chair pro tem.

James Weeks was recognized for a nomination speech. He instead disrobed to musical accompaniment. Many delegates strenuously objected and attempted to raise points of order. Mr. Weeks then announced his withdrawal from the race for LNC Chair.

Speaking to the nomination of Brett Pojunis were: Zach Foster (NV), Dana Moxley-Cummings (FL), Alexander Snitker (FL), Jeff Hewitt (CA), an unidentified delegate, Rick Perkins (TX), and Brett Pojunis.

Results for the second ballot for Vice-President were ready at 5:45 p.m., but the results were held while speeches continued.

Following protests from several delegates over Mr. Weeks' actions, Aaron Starr (CA) raised point of order that Mr. Weeks had defrauded the convention delegates, thus he moved to suspend the rules to propose a resolution. Roger Gary (TX) moved to suspend the rules for the purpose of revoking the membership of James

Weeks. Dr. Lark ruled Mr. Gary's motion to be out of order. A voice vote on the Starr motion failed by a voice vote.

Dr. Phillies raised a point of order that Section 73 of Robert's Rules grants an assembly the right to eject a member, thus Mr. Gary's motion should have been ruled to be in order.¹³ Dr. Lark ruled the point well taken. Roger Gary (TX) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes for the purpose of considering a disciplinary motion regarding James Weeks. After Dr. Lark requested clarification, Mr. Gary withdrew his motion, which had not yet been stated by the chair.

Following an on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results of the second ballot for Vice-President were announced at 5:55 p.m. as follows:

Vice-President – Ballot 2

Candidate	Votes	Percent
William Weld	441	50.573%
Larry Sharpe	409	46.904%
NOTA (write-in)	12	1.376%
Derrick Grayson (withdrew)	9	1.032%
Mark Stewart (write-in)	1	0.115%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 872 ballots cast, William Weld was elected as the 2016 Libertarian Party nominee for Vice-President.

Omar Recuero (FL) moved to suspend the rules for 5 minutes to allow a speech from the vice-presidential nominee. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

During proceedings, Dan Wiener (CA) raised a point of order that people were mischaracterizing their intentions as points of order so as to get preference in recognition and interrupt other business for non-privileged motions or simply to make commentary.

As the nomination speeches for LNC Chair had been suspended, Dr. Lark returned the gavel to Mr. Sarwark.

William Weld addressed the assembly. With the indulgence of the body, Larry Sharpe was granted 2 minutes for a concession speech.

LNC CHAIR ELECTION

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Jim Lark for continuation of the nomination speeches for LNC Chair.

Speaking to the nomination of Nicholas Sarwark were: D. Frank Robinson, Arvin Vohra (MD), and Nicholas Sarwark.

Speaking to the nomination of Mark Rutherford were: Mike Knebel (NE), Jess Mears (FL), and Mark Rutherford.

Tom Glass (TX) raised a point of order that we have technically only heard points of information about who the nominees would be, but have not technically nominated them at a time when it was in order, and we should do so now. There was no objection to considering Brett Pojunis, Mark Rutherford, and Nick Sarwark as the duly nominated candidates for LNC Chair as a result of the prior points of information.

Ballots for LNC Chair were distributed at 6:35 p.m.

Steven Nielsen (WA) asked whether a quorum was present. Dr. Lark ruled there is a quorum present. Jeff Wood (PA) requested a quorum call. Dr. Lark ruled there is a quorum present.

Following an on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results of the first ballot for LNC Chair were announced at 7:09 p.m. as follows:

LNC Chair – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Nicholas Sarwark	464	64.714%
Brett Pojunis	135	18.828%
Mark Rutherford	108	15.063%
NOTA (write-in)	5	0.697%
Weeks (write-in)	2	0.279%
Trey Waites (write-in)	1	0.139%
Brett Bittner (write-in)	1	0.139%
Vermin Supreme (write-in)	1	0.139%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 717 ballots cast, Nicholas Sarwark was elected as LNC Chair.

A motion to adjourn until 8:30 a.m. Monday was adopted by a voice vote at 7:12 p.m.

DAY 4 – CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

Mr. Sarwark called the convention back to order at 8:30 a.m. on Monday, May 30, 2016.

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 797 delegates and 87 alternates who are entitled to cast 843 votes. Quorum is 338.

Ms. Salvette reported the following requested changes to the list of delegates eligible to register:

Change: Michelle Gregoire – move from ND alternate to MI alternate

Addition: D. Frank Robinson - PA alternate

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention and that the changes to the list of those eligible to register be approved.

Aaron Starr (CA) raised a point of order a quorum did not seem to be present, thus the convention could not conduct business.¹⁴ Mr. Sarwark started to put the question on the updated credentials report. Aaron Starr (CA) again raised a point of order that the motion to adopt the credentials report is not one of the limited things that can be done absent a quorum.¹⁴ Mr. Sarwark found the point well taken and urged those present to try to bring more delegates into the hall. Roger Gary (TX) reported his rough estimate count found only 188 people in the room.

While waiting to obtain quorum, the assembly permitted speeches in anticipation of Arvin Vohra's eventual nomination for LNC Vice-Chair so that he could depart for an appointment. Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Dr. Lark. Nominating speeches for Arvin Vohra were given by Nick Sarwark (AZ) and Arvin Vohra. Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

Mark Stewart (CT) moved to suspend the rules to consider a resolution regarding how to support our presidential ticket. The motion was ruled out of order due to lack of quorum.¹⁴

Tom Glass (TX) raised a point of order that his understanding was that under Robert's Rules, if the chair merely notes the presence of a quorum, then quorum is assumed until someone questions it.¹⁵ Mr. Sarwark inquired whether there was objection to him noting the presence of a quorum. There was objection. Roger Gary (TX) reported an updated rough estimate of 280 people in the room.

Lucy Branton (IN) requested recognition for a point of order, but instead made a motion that we create a campaign donation oversight committee. The motion was ruled to be out of order, due to lack of a quorum.¹⁴

At 9:16 a.m., the secretary's estimated count of people in the room was 326. Mr. Sarwark asked if there was objection to noting a quorum of 372 was present. There was objection.¹⁶

At 9:26 a.m. Mr. Starr moved that we count to determine whether quorum had developed. A count found 421 delegates present. Mr. Sarwark noted that a quorum was present.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 707 delegates and 83 alternates who are entitled to cast 763 votes. Quorum is 306.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention and that the changes to the list of those eligible to register be approved as reported at the 8:30 call to order. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

BYLAWS AND RULES COMMITTEE PROPOSAL - QUORUM

Without objection, the chair recognized Aaron Starr (CA) who moved a bylaw amendment proposal from the Bylaws and Rules Committee as follows:

ARTICLE 11: CONVENTIONS

9. Quorum:

For the purpose of electing Party officials, a quorum shall consist of one-third of the maximum number of delegates registered in attendance at the Convention. For all other business, A-a quorum shall consist of 40%a majority of the total-maximum number of delegates registered in attendance at the Convention.

Following debate, the motion failed by a standing vote.

A delegate moved to amend Bylaw Article 9. The motion was ruled to be out of order.

ELECTION OF PARTY OFFICERS

LNC VICE-CHAIR NOMINATIONS

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Jim Lark to serve as chair pro tem, and nominations were opened for LNC Vice-Chair.

Rebecca Sink-Burris (IN) nominated Sam Goldstein.

Nick Sarwark (AZ) nominated Arvin Vohra.

Mark Herd (CA) nominated Brett Pojunis.

Paul Stanton (FL) nominated Marc Allan Feldman.

Lou Jasikoff (PA) nominated Jason Scheurer.

As two nominees were not present and had not stated their intentions in advance, Mr. Sarwark obtained a confirmation that Dr. Feldman is willing to serve, but no confirmation was available about whether Mr. Pojunis was willing to serve.

Nominations were closed without objection.

Chris Maden (IL) moved to suspend the rules and shorten the LNC Vice-Chair nomination speeches for the remaining candidates (Mr. Vohra's 5-minute time allotment had occurred earlier) to 3 minutes each. The motion failed on a voice vote.

Speaking for Sam Goldstein were: Doug Craig (GA), Ken Moellman (KY), and Sam Goldstein.

No speakers for Brett Pojunis approached the stage.

Speaking for Marc Allan Feldman were: Paul Stanton (FL), Gary Johnson (TX), Tricia Sprankle (OH), and Marc Allan Feldman.

Speaking for Jason Scheurer was: Jason Scheurer.

Mark Herd (CA) requested to withdraw his nomination of Brett Pojunis. There was no objection.

Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

Steve Scheetz (PA) moved to suspend the rules and limit nominating speeches for the remaining LNC positions to 3 minutes each. The motion was adopted without objection.

LNC SECRETARY NOMINATIONS

During the voting for LNC Vice-Chair, nominations were opened for LNC Secretary.

Jim Fulner (MI) nominated Jeff Wood.

A delegate moved to close nominations. Mr. Sarwark ruled it out of order, with another nominator seeking recognition.

Sam Goldstein (IN) nominated Alicia Mattson.

Nominations were closed without objection.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

At 10:10 a.m. Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 699 delegates and 81 alternates who are entitled to cast 759 votes. Quorum is 304.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

ELECTION OF PARTY OFFICERS (CONTINUED)

LNC SECRETARY NOMINATIONS (continued)

Speaking for Alicia Mattson were: Jeff Hewitt (CA) and Alicia Mattson.

Speaking for Jeff Wood were: Jim Fulner (MI) and Jeff Wood.

LNC TREASURER NOMINATIONS

During the tabulation of votes for LNC Vice-Chair, nominations were opened for LNC Treasurer.

Gary Johnson (TX) nominated Tim Hagan.
Ken Moellman (OH) nominated Joshua Wilcoxson.

Nominations for LNC Treasurer were closed without objection.

Speaking for Tim Hagan were: Gary Johnson (TX), Guy McLendon (LA), and Tim Hagan.
Speaking for Joshua Wilcoxson was: Joshua Wilcoxson.

JUDICIAL COMMITTEE NOMINATIONS

Steve Scheetz (PA) moved to limit nominating speeches for LNC At-Large to 2 minutes each. The motion was adopted by a voice vote.

There was no objection to limiting nominating speeches for Judicial Committee to 1 minute each.

Without objection, nominations were opened for Judicial Committee, though At-Large nominations had not yet taken place.

Chris Maden (IL) nominated himself.
Sam Sloan (CA) nominated Tom Stevens.
Lonnie Holcomb (NC) nominated Mikel Hautzinger.
Gary Johnson (TX) nominated himself.
John Buttrick (AZ) nominated Michael Kielsky.
Tricia Sprankle (OH) nominated Stephen Linnabary.
Caryn Ann Harlos (CO) nominated Chuck Moulton.
Rob Latham (UT) nominated Roger Roots.
Regina Brim (MS) nominated Jeff Mortenson.
Michael Dixon (IL) nominated himself.
Jeff Wood (PA) nominated Jim Fulner.
Sam Goldstein (IN) nominated Rebecca Sink-Burris.
David Malekar (WA) nominated Alicia Dearn.
S.L. Malleck (MN) nominated John Bowers.
Daniel Hayes (LA) nominated BetteRose Ryan, but Ms. Ryan later declined.
John Karr (PA) nominated Steve Scheetz, but Mr. Scheetz later declined, indicating he is not eligible to serve.
Ellen Blickman (SC) nominated Rich Piotrowski.
Joshua Katz (CT) nominated M Carling.
Ken Moellman (KY) nominated Chris Robinson.
Dave Capano (KY) nominated Chris Wiest.
Ruth Bennett (AZ) nominated Daniel Hayes, but Mr. Hayes declined the nomination.

Nominations for Judicial Committee were closed without objection.

LNC VICE-CHAIR ELECTION RESULTS

Following an on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results of the first ballot for LNC Vice-Chair were announced at 10:39 a.m. as follows:

LNC Vice-Chair – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Arvin Vohra	206	47.685%
Sam Goldstein	90	20.833%
Jason Scheurer	77	17.824%
Marc Allan Feldman	56	12.963%

NOTA (write-in)	3	0.694%
-----------------	---	--------

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Since no candidate attained a majority of the 432 ballots cast, pursuant to Convention Rule 8.1.c, Marc Allan Feldman, as the candidate with the fewest votes, was dropped from the second ballot. Both Jason Scheurer and Sam Goldstein withdrew from the second ballot, leaving Arvin Vohra as the only nominated candidate.

A delegate moved to suspend the rules and elect the LNC Vice-Chair by acclamation. The motion was adopted by a voice vote. A motion to elect Arvin Vohra as LNC Vice-Chair was adopted with a voice vote.

AT-LARGE COMMITTEE NOMINATIONS

Mr. Sarwark inquired whether there was objection to his nominating someone for LNC At-Large while he was chairing the meeting. There was objection, but a motion to allow that was adopted by a voice vote.

Nominations were opened for LNC At-Large.

Without objection, Alicia Mattson's name was placed in nomination for LNC At-Large, with the understanding that she would withdraw in the event that she won re-election as LNC Secretary.

Nick Sarwark (AZ) nominated Sam Goldstein.
 Jim Lark (VA) nominated Bill Redpath.
 Caryn Ann Harlos (CO) nominated Darryl Perry.
 David Ziebell (GA) nominated Jason Scheurer.
 Mark Hinkle (CA) nominated himself.
 Paul Stanton (FL) nominated Charles Peralo.
 Sam Sloan (CA) nominated Starchild.
 Michael Kielsky (AZ) nominated John Buttrick.
 Sam Goldstein (IN) nominated Kevin Ludlow.
 Guy McLendon (LA) nominated Jen Werther.
 Roger Roots (MT) nominated Andy Jacobs.
 Danny Bedwell (MS) nominated Boyd Kendall.
 Jim Rosenbeck (NY) nominated Kimberly Ruff.
 Richard Schwarz (PA) nominated Steve Scheetz.
 Jeff Hewitt (CA) nominated Daniel Hayes.
 Tim Hagan (NV) nominated Joe Buchman.
 Mark Herd (CA) nominated himself.
 Gary Johnson (TX) nominated Roger Gary.
 Paul Grindle (AK) nominated Marc Allan Feldman.

Nominations for LNC At-Large were closed without objection.

Ballots for LNC Secretary and LNC Treasurer were distributed at 10:50 a.m. during LNC At-Large nominations.

Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra for a few minutes before Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

Michael Dixon (IL) moved to suspend the rules for consideration of a motion to eliminate nomination speeches for LNC At-Large. The suspension failed by a voice vote.

Arvin Vohra (MD) moved to limit nomination speeches for at-large to 1 minute per candidate. The motion was adopted with a voice vote.

Nomination speeches for LNC At-Large were as follows:

Darryl Perry (NH) spoke for Kim Ruff, Starchild, Jennifer Werther, and Steve Scheetz, and they also received individual nominating speeches below.

Speaking for Charles Peralo was: Charles Peralo (WY).

Speaking for Mark Hinkle was: Mark Hinkle (CA)

Speaking for Bill Redpath were: Jim Lark (VA) and Bill Redpath.

Speaking for Jason Scheurer was: Jason Scheurer.

Speaking for Roger Gary was: Roger Gary.

Speaking for John Buttrick were: Ernie Hancock (AZ) and John Buttrick.

Speaking for Jennifer Werther were: Guy McLendon (LA) and Jennifer Werther.

Speaking for Starchild was: Starchild.

Speaking for Kevin Ludlow were: Sam Goldstein (IN) and Kevin Ludlow.

Speaking for Sam Goldstein were: Kevin Ludlow (TX) and Sam Goldstein.

Speaking for Boyd Kendall were: Danny Bedwell (MS) and Boyd Kendall.

Speaking for Kim Ruff was: Kim Ruff.

Speaking for Andy Jacobs was: Andy Jacobs.

Speaking for Steve Scheetz was: Jim Fulner (MI).

Speaking for Joe Buchman were: Chris Thrasher (CA) and Joe Buchman.

Speaking for Mark Herd was: Mark Herd.

Speaking for Daniel Hayes were: Jeff Hewitt (CA), BetteRose Ryan (AZ), and Daniel Hayes.

During the LNC At-Large speeches, Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Mr. Vohra, and tabulation was completed for the LNC Secretary election.

Ballots for LNC At-Large were distributed at 10:57 a.m., at which time Alicia Mattson withdrew from the LNC At-Large race, though her name was already printed on the ballot.

Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

LNC SECRETARY ELECTION RESULTS

Following adoption of a motion to dispense with the on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results of the first ballot for LNC Secretary were announced at 11:05 a.m. as follows:

LNC Secretary – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Alicia Mattson	298	70.118%
Jeff Wood	108	25.412%
NOTA (write-in)	19	4.471%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 425 ballots cast, Alicia Mattson was elected as LNC Secretary.

JUDICIAL COMMITTEE NOMINATIONS (continued)

During the tabulation for LNC Treasurer, the nomination speeches for Judicial Committee were as follows:

Speaking for Chris Maden was: Chris Maden.

Speaking for M Carling were: Bill Redpath (VA) and M Carling.

Speaking for Gary Johnson were: Tim Hagan (NV) and Bo Zimmerman (TX).

Speaking for Michael Kielsky were: Ernie Hancock (AZ), John Buttrick (AZ), and Michael Kielsky.

Speaking for Mikel Hautzinger were: Ruth Bennett (AZ) and Mikel Hautzinger.

Speaking for Michael Dixon was: Michael Dixon.

Speaking for Steve Linnabary were: Tricia Sprankle (OH) and Steve Linnabary.

Speaking for Roger Roots were: Rob Latham (UT) and Roger Roots.
Speaking for Tom Stevens was: Sam Sloan (CA).
Speaking for Chris Robinson was: Chris Robinson.
Speaking for John Bowers were: S.L. Malleck (MN), Michael Pakko (AR) and John Bowers.
Speaking for Chuck Moulton were: Caryn Ann Harlos (CO) and Chuck Moulton.
Speaking for Chris Wiest was: Dave Capano (KY).
Speaking for Alicia Dearn was: Benjamin Judah Phelps (WA).
Speaking for Rich Piotrowski was: Rich Piotrowski.
Speaking for Jim Fulner was: Jim Fulner.
Speaking for Rebecca Sink-Burris were: Jim Lark (VA) and Rebecca Sink-Burris.
Speaking for Jeff Mortenson were: Danny Bedwell (MS) and Jeff Mortenson.
Speaking for Tom Stevens again, though his time had already been used was: Mark Stewart (CT).

LNC TREASURER ELECTION RESULTS

There being no objection to dispensing with the on-screen review of the secretary's tally spreadsheet, the results of the first ballot for LNC Treasurer were announced at 11:58 a.m. as follows:

LNC Treasurer – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Tim Hagan	252	60.000%
Joshua Wilcoxson	152	36.190%
George Phillies (write-in)	3	0.714%
NOTA (write-in)	13	3.095%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 420 ballots cast, Tim Hagan was elected as LNC Treasurer.

MEMORIAL DAY OBSERVANCE

At the request of Ken Kaplan (NJ) the convention attendees observed moment of silence in memory of those who gave their lives to secure and preserve our liberty.

CREDENTIALS COMMITTEE UPDATE

At 12:04 p.m. Ms. Salvette presented an update from the Credentials Committee, with registration totals being 648 delegates and 80 alternates who are entitled to cast 709 votes. Quorum is 284.

On behalf of the Credentials Committee, Ms. Salvette moved that the updated roll submitted to the secretary by the Credentials Committee be the official voting roll of the convention. The motion was adopted without objection.

ELECTION OF PARTY OFFICERS (CONTINUED)

Ballots for the Judicial Committee were distributed at 12:05 p.m. while At-Large voting continued.

SUSPENSION OF THE RULES

Darryl Perry (NH) moved to adopt the following resolution: "The Libertarian Party calls for a full pardon for political prisoners and heroes, specifically Ross Ulbricht and Private Chelsea Manning." The motion was adopted by voice vote.

Without objection, Mr. Sarwark yielded the gavel to Bill Redpath to serve as chair pro tem.

George Phillies (MA) moved to suspend the rules and have the secretary display counts-so-far in the LNC At-Large race. Tabulation had not yet started for that race, thus it would have been impossible to comply with the motion even if adopted.

Trent Poole (WI) moved to suspend the rules and elect the top-X finishers in the LNC At-Large and Judicial Committee elections. Mr. Redpath ruled the motion out of order.¹⁷

Mr. Sarwark resumed the gavel.

Jim Fulner (MI) moved that we adopt the following resolution: "Be it resolved, taxation is theft." Following debate, the resolution was adopted by a voice vote.

Guy McLendon (LA) moved that we adopt the following resolution: "Resolved, the Libertarian Party supports a full pardon of whistleblower and hero Edward Snowden." The resolution was adopted by a voice vote.

A delegate called for orders of the day, but Mr. Sarwark ruled that he needed to be recognized first.¹⁸

Max Abramson (NH) moved that we adopt the following resolution:

"Resolved, we, the national convention, disavow the narcissistic behavior of Mr. Weeks in his vulgar display on stage during the Chair's nomination speeches and ask that the American public not dismiss our message based on the antics of someone who does not represent us."

Mr. Sarwark ruled the resolution out of order as a personal attack on a credentialed delegate.¹⁹ The ruling of the chair was appealed. The ruling of the chair was sustained on a voice vote.

BetteRose Ryan (AZ) called for orders of the day.

Mr. Sarwark confirmed that all delegations had submitted all of their election tally sheets to the secretary. Results for LNC At-Large and Judicial Committee were announced post-adjourment.

ADJOURNMENT

At 12:47 p.m., a motion to adjourn was adopted by a voice vote.

POST-ADJOURNMENT ELECTION RESULTS

LNC AT-LARGE ELECTION RESULTS

The results of the LNC At-Large election were as follows:

LNC At-Large – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Sam Goldstein	244	58.373%
Bill Redpath	226	54.067%
Mark Feldman	175	41.866%
Darryl Perry	168	40.191%
Starchild	154	36.842%
Daniel Hayes	149	35.646%
Jennifer Werther	139	33.254%

John Buttrick	136	32.536%
Charles Peralo	125	29.904%
Kevin Ludlow	117	27.990%
Jason Scheurer	116	27.751%
Joe Buchman	112	26.794%
Mark Hinkle	103	24.641%
Kimberly Ruff	93	22.249%
Andy Jacobs	85	20.335%
Steve Scheetz	67	16.029%
Mark Herd	62	14.833%
Roger Gary	34	8.134%
Boyd Kendall	23	5.502%
Alicia Mattson (withdrew)	6	1.435%
Jim Lark (write-in)	3	0.718%
Larkin (write-in)	3	0.718%
Gary Johnson (write-in)	2	0.478%
Guy McLendon (write-in)	2	0.478%
Jeff Wood (write-in)	2	0.478%
Campbell (write-in)	1	0.239%
Candle (write-in)	1	0.239%
Gregson (write-in)	1	0.239%
Hancock (write-in)	1	0.239%
Linnabary (write-in)	1	0.239%
Wortham (write-in)	1	0.239%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 418 ballots cast, Sam Goldstein and Bill Redpath were elected to LNC At-Large seats. Three additional seats remained vacant.

JUDICIAL COMMITTEE LECTION RESULTS

The results of the Judicial Committee election were as follows:

Judicial Committee – Ballot 1

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Alicia Dearn	216	59.178%
Gary Johnson (TX)	193	52.877%
Chuck Moulton	184	50.411%
Rebecca Sink-Burris	146	40.000%
Michael Dixon	115	31.507%
M Carling	109	29.863%
Michael Kielsky	107	29.315%
John Bowers	103	28.219%
Mikel Hutzinger	99	27.123%
Steve Linnabary	97	26.575%
Roger Roots	95	26.027%
Chris Maden	69	18.904%
Chris Wiest	68	18.630%
Jim Fulner	54	14.795%
Jeff Mortenson	53	14.521%
Chris Robinson	52	14.247%

Rich Piotrowski	37	10.137%
Tom Stevens	28	7.671%
Tom Lippman	17	4.658%
BetteRose Ryan (write-in)	9	2.466%
NOTA (write-in)	9	2.466%
Sprinkle (write-in)	6	1.644%
Larry Sharpe (write-in)	2	0.548%
Gary Johnson (NM) (write-in)	2	0.548%
Ruth Bennett (write-in)	1	0.274%
John Buttrick (write-in)	1	0.274%
Brett Pojunis (write-in)	1	0.274%
Darryl Perry (write-in)	1	0.274%
Jim Gray (write-in)	1	0.274%
John Bowman (write-in)	1	0.274%
Bill Weld (write-in)	1	0.274%
James Weeks (write-in)	1	0.274%
Ron Paul (write-in)	1	0.274%

See the state-by-state subtotals in the appendices.

Having received a majority of the 365 ballots cast, Alicia Dearn, Gary Johnson (TX), and Chuck Moulton were elected to Judicial Committee seats. Four additional seats remained vacant.

SPECIAL THANKS

It takes a team to do the job of Secretary in a convention which uses paper ballots for 1000 delegates. I want to offer a very special thanks to Joshua Katz as the Secretary's assistant, who oversaw token counting, helped the tellers, and took notes for me when the convention forged ahead with business while I was tallying election results. My team of tellers (M Carling, Bob Johnston, Sandra Kallander, Chris Maden, Akeem Robinson, Stacey Selleck, and Scott Spencer) counted tokens, distributed ballots, double-checked affiliate submissions, read affiliate tally sheets to me for tabulation, organized paperwork, found ways to do things more efficiently, and took the initiative to do whatever they saw needed to be done. I could not have done it all without you. THANK YOU!!!

Alicia Mattson
LNC Secretary

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

President - Round 1									
State	Feldman	Johnson	McAfee	McCormick	Perry	Petersen	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	58	458	131	9	63	197	4	5	925
AL		7	3		2	1			13
AK	1					5			6
AZ	2	11	7	2	2	2			26
AR	1	4	3					1	9
CA	4	48	21	3	4	33	2		115
CO		17	1		2	2	1		23
CT		3	3			4			10
DE		1		1		1			3
DC		3							3
FL	4	28	3		5	13			53
GA	5	9	8		4	5			31
HI		4				1			5
ID		6				1			7
IL		19	3		1	4			27
IN	1	18	4		2	9			34
IA	2	3	1	1		3			10
KS		2			1	2			5
KY	1	7	3						11
LA		4				8		1	13
ME		2				5			7
MD	4	10			2	2			18
MA		8	3						11
MI	2	15	5		1	1		1	25
MN		5			2	2			9
MS		6	1			1			8
MO	1	7	1	1	1	12		1	24
MT	1	1	2		1	2			7
NE		2				6			8
NV		11				1		1	13
NH		1	2		5	1			9
NJ	2	9	5		2	3			21
NM		11			2				13
NY	1	16	3		3	16			39
NC	4	18	2	1	1	3			29
ND		1	2			2			5
OH	8	21	3			9			41
OK	1	2	1		1	1			6
OR									0
PA	3	16	4		12	6			41
RI		3							3
SC		9				4			13
SD		1							1
TN		14	3		1				18
TX	7	26	15		2	10			60
UT	1	2	2			2	1		8
VT			3						3
VA	1	19	2		2	6			30
WA	1	13	10			3			27
WV						5			5
WI		13	2		1				16
WY		2			1				3

Write-Ins:

CA: Vermin Supreme (1)
CO: Derrick Grayson (1)

CA: Heidi Zemen (1)
UT: Ron Paul (1)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

President - Round 2								
State	Feldman	Johnson	McAfee	Perry	Petersen	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	18	518	131	52	203	4	2	928
AL		9	2	1	1			13
AK	1				5			6
AZ		11	8	2	4		1	26
AR		5	4					9
CA	1	56	25	2	33			117
CO	1	17	1	3	1	1		24
CT		4		1	4	1		10
DE		1			2			3
DC		3						3
FL	2	31	5	3	12			53
GA	1	10	10	2	8			31
HI		4			1			5
ID		6			1			7
IL		19	3	1	4			27
IN	1	24	1		8			34
IA		4	2		5			11
KS		2			4			6
KY		8	3					11
LA		4		1	8			13
ME		2			5			7
MD	2	10	1	2				15
MA		8	3					11
MI	1	16	4	2	1		1	25
MN		8		1	1			10
MS		6	1		1			8
MO		10		1	13			24
MT		2	3		2			7
NE		2			5	1		8
NV		11			2			13
NH		2	4	3	1			10
NJ	1	11	4	2	3			21
NM		12			1			13
NY		20	1	3	15			39
NC	1	19	3	1	5			29
ND		2	2		1			5
OH	3	21	7		9			40
OK		3			3			6
OR								0
PA		18	4	12	7			41
RI		3						3
SC		8		1	4			13
SD		1						1
TN		14	3	1				18
TX	2	34	12	3	8	1		60
UT		5			3			8
VT			3					3
VA		21	2	2	5			30
WA	1	13	10		3			27
WV		1			4			5
WI		15		1				16
WY		2		1				3

Write-Ins:

CO: Derrick Grayson (1)
NE: Michael Shannon (1)

CT: Kevin McCormick (1)
TX: Rhett Smith (1)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

Vice-President - Round 1								
State	Coley	Deam	Grayson	Sharpe	Weld	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	93	29	48	264	426	3	6	869
AL	2			4	5		2	13
AK	3		2	1				6
AZ	2		1	10	12		1	26
AR			3	2	3			8
CA	10	7	4	28	49		1	99
CO	3		2	4	15			24
CT	2	1	1	3	3			10
DE		2						2
DC					3			3
FL	5	1	4	13	29	1		53
GA	10		4	4	12			30
HI				1	4			5
ID				1	6			7
IL	3	0	2	4	15			24
IN	1		4	7	22			34
IA	1		1	4	4			10
KS	1	1		2	1			5
KY				3	6			9
LA	1	1		8	3			13
ME			3		3			6
MD	2			6	7			15
MA	1			2	8			11
MI	5	4		1	15			25
MN	1			2	6			9
MS				8				8
MO	2		2	10	8	1		23
MT				4	2			6
NE				7	1			8
NV				4	10			14
NH	3		1	5	1			10
NJ	2		1	5	10			18
NM					10			10
NY	3			30	8			41
NC	3	3	2	6	11			25
ND	1		1		2			4
OH	6	4	4	5	17		1	37
OK				5	1			6
OR								0
PA	11		2	9	16			38
RI					3			3
SC				6	5			11
SD					1			1
TN				2	13	1		16
TX	2	2		27	24			55
UT		1	2		5			8
VT	2			1				3
VA	1	1	1	7	19		1	30
WA		1		12	13			26
WV	3		1	1				5
WI	1				12			13
WY					3			3

Write-Ins:

FL: Austin Petersen (1)

MO: Daniel Hogan (1)

TN: Gary Johnson (1)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

Vice-President - Round 2						
State	Grayson	Sharpe	Weld	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	9	409	441	1	12	872
AL		6	6		1	13
AK		6				6
AZ		12	12			24
AR	2	2	4			8
CA	1	51	49		1	102
CO	1	6	16		1	24
CT	1	6	2	1		10
DE		1	1			2
DC			3			3
FL	0	22	31			53
GA	1	20	10			31
HI			5			5
ID		1	6			7
IL	1	9	14			24
IN		12	22			34
IA		6	4			10
KS		4	1			5
KY		3	7		1	11
LA		11	2			13
ME		3	3			6
MD		10	1		1	12
MA		3	8			11
MI		6	18		1	25
MN		3	5			8
MS			8			8
MO		16	7			23
MT		6	1			7
NE		7	1			8
NV		3	11			14
NH		10				10
NJ		7	11		1	19
NM			10			10
NY		31	9			40
NC		10	15			25
ND		2	3			5
OH		22	11		3	36
OK		5	1			6
OR						0
PA		20	18			38
RI			3			3
SC		6	5			11
SD			1			1
TN	2	2	14			18
TX		29	28			57
UT		2	5			7
VT		3				3
VA		7	18		2	27
WA		12	14			26
WV		5				5
WI		1	13			14
WY			4			4

Write-Ins:

CT: Mark Stewart (1)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

LNC Chair						
State	Pojunis	Rutherford	Sanwark	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	135	108	464	5	5	717
AL	1	1	11			13
AK	2	2	1			5
AZ	4	2	14			20
AR	1		7			8
CA	23	15	28			66
CO	2		18			20
CT	2	1	3			6
DE						0
DC		3				3
FL	14	4	33			51
GA	2	1	21	2		26
HI	1		4			5
ID		6	1			7
IL		5	14			19
IN		22	11			33
IA	1		8			9
KS		2	4			6
KY	1		8			9
LA	8		5			13
ME	1		2			3
MD			12			12
MA			7		1	8
MI		6	19			25
MN			7			7
MS			8			8
MO	2	3	13			18
MT		3	4			7
NE	1	4	3			8
NV	13		1			14
NH	1	1	7			9
NJ	5		10			15
NM	5					5
NY	5	2	24			31
NC	5	1	10	1		17
ND		3	2			5
OH	4	6	20			30
OK			6			6
OR						0
PA	2	3	20		3	28
RI		3				3
SC			10			10
SD	1					1
TN		1	10	2		13
TX	14	1	35			50
UT	3		2			5
VT	1		2			3
VA	1	5	17		1	24
WA	4	2	17			23
WV						0
WI	3		5			8
WY	2					2

Write-Ins:

GA: Trey Waites (1)
NC: Vermin Supreme (1)

GA: Brett Bittner (1)
TN: James Weeks (2)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

LNC Vice-Chair						
State	Feldman	Goldstein	Scheurer	Vohra	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	56	90	77	206	3	432
AL	2	4	3	4		13
AK	2					2
AZ	2	1	3	12	2	20
AR	2			3		5
CA	3	10	2	6		21
CO	1	1	1	6		9
CT		1	2	1		4
DE						0
DC						0
FL	7	1	9	9		26
GA		6	1	2		9
HI	1		1	1		3
ID	1	1				2
IL	1	1		6		8
IN		27				27
IA	1	2		2		5
KS			1	2		3
KY	2	1	1	1	1	6
LA	1		3	9		13
ME				1		1
MD				6		6
MA		1		5		6
MI	3	4	2	14		23
MN	1			3		4
MS		4	2			6
MO	4			5		9
MT	2	1		2		5
NE			1	3		4
NV		1	1			2
NH		2		4		6
NJ			4	6		10
NM			4			4
NY	2		4	12		18
NC		2		10		12
ND		3		1		4
OH	2	4		8		14
OK			4			4
OR						0
PA	5		3	12		20
RI	1	1		1		3
SC	1	1	4	4		10
SD						0
TN		1		1		2
TX	3	3	13	21		40
UT	1		1	2		4
VT				3		3
VA	1	4	5	9		19
WA	2	1		9		12
WV						0
WI		1	1			2
WY	2		1			3

Write-Ins:
(none besides NOTA)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

LNC Secretary				
State	Matson	Wood	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	298	108	19	425
AL	8	4		12
AK	2			2
AZ	8	11	1	20
AR	5			5
CA	16	9		25
CO	6	2	1	9
CT	1	3		4
DE				0
DC				0
FL	17	5	1	23
GA	4	4		8
HI	2	1		3
ID	2			2
IL	5	1		6
IN	26			26
IA	6			6
KS	1	2		3
KY	3		2	5
LA	13			13
ME	1			1
MD	5	2		7
MA	4	2		6
MI	12	6	4	22
MN	1	1	1	3
MS	4	1	1	6
MO	4	4		8
MT	1	3		4
NE	4			4
NV	3			3
NH	2	3		5
NJ	6	2		8
NM	3		1	4
NY	18			18
NC	9	3		12
ND	4			4
OH	14	1		15
OK	4			4
OR				0
PA	2	17		19
RI	1	2		3
SC	8		2	10
SD				0
TN	2			2
TX	27	10		37
UT	3	1		4
VT	1	1	1	3
VA	16	2	2	20
WA	11	3	2	16
WV				0
WI	1	1		2
WY	2	1		3

Write-Ins:
(none besides NOTA)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

LNC Treasurer					
State	Hagan	Wilcoxson	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Total
Total	252	152	3	13	420
AL	6	6			12
AK	2				2
AZ	13	7			20
AR	5				5
CA	14	10			24
CO	4	5			9
CT		5			5
DE					0
DC					0
FL	17	3		2	22
GA	2	6			8
HI	1	2			3
ID	1	1			2
IL	5				5
IN	5	20		1	26
IA	4	2			6
KS	2	1			3
KY	3	1		1	5
LA	10	3			13
ME	1				1
MD	7				7
MA	2	3			5
MI	14	7		1	22
MN	3				3
MS	4	2			6
MO	2	5			7
MT	3	1			4
NE	4				4
NV	3				3
NH	2	3			5
NJ	6	1			7
NM	3	1			4
NY	15	2		1	18
NC	7	4			11
ND		4			4
OH	5	10			15
OK	4				4
OR					0
PA	10	2		5	17
RI			3		3
SC	8	2			10
SD					0
TN	2				2
TX	30	8			38
UT		4			4
VT	3				3
VA	6	16			22
WA	10	5		1	16
WV					0
WI	1			1	2
WY	3				3

Write-Ins:

RI: George Phillies (3)

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

LNC At-Large																						
State	Buchman	Buttrick	Feldman	Gary	Goldstein	Hayes	Herd	Hinkle	Jacobs	Kendall	Ludlow	Mattson (withdrawn)	Peralo	Perry	Redpath	Ruff	Scheurer	Sheetz	Starchild	Werther	write-in	NOTA (write-in)
Total	112	136	175	34	244	149	62	103	85	23	117	6	125	168	226	93	116	67	154	139	18	0
AL	3	5	8	1	9	7	2	3	1	3	2		7	8	10	3	1	2	7	4		
AK			1		1	1									1				1			
AZ	1	14	6	2	10	6		2	1		2		5	5	8	5	6	2	5	4		
AR	2	2	1		3	4	2	3	1	1	3		3	1	5	1				2		
CA	9	8	9	2	15	5	8	10	7	1	5		10	7	14	3	4	3	10	8		
CO	5	2	2		7	3	1	4	2		3		2	5	2	2	6	1	5	1		
CT	2	1	3	1	4	3	2	1	4	1	2	1	1	4	3	1		1	3	1		
DE																						
DC																						
FL	8	12	9	1	13	16	8	13	10	1	10		6	9	14	3	6	3	12	11	1	
GA			5		6						1			5	1	2	4	5	2	1		
HI	1	2	2		2	1	1		1				1		2							
ID		1	1					1							1	1			1	1		
IL		1	1		3			1			1				2	1		1	1	1		
IN	3	5	1	1	21	4	1	1	1		12		1	1	9	1		1		3		
IA	2	4	5		5		2	1			3	1		5	6	1			5	2		
KS																						
KY		1	4	1	4				1	1				5	2		1		5	3		
LA			3	1	5	11		1			1		6	1	8		5			4	1	
ME			1		1			1			1			1	1							
MD	2		4		3	1		3	1		3		1	6	3	3	2	3	2	2		
MA	4	4	3	2	5	1	3	1	3		2		5	2	2	2	3	1	3	3		
MI	3	14	8	1	17	8	2	8	1	0	3		7	6	16	5	6	4	7	6		
MN		1			2		1	2	1	1	1		2	2	2	1		2	2	2		
MS	1	0	3	0	3	1			2	4				1	2		3		1	6		
MO	2	2	7		7	2		1	1		2		3	6	3	2	2	2	3	3	3	
MT		1	1		2	1			1				1	2	1				2	1		
NE	1	2	4		3	1			1	3	1			5	3		3		4	2		
NV	3	1			3	2	3				2		2		1		2			3		
NH	1	3	3		4	2	1	1	1	1	2			4	1	4	3	2	3	3		
NJ	1	1	3		4	2	2	1	3		1		2	4	6	3	6	2	5	3	2	
NM	3		2						1				4	2	3		4		3		3	
NY	1	3	4		7	5			6		1		7	11	3	16	5	3	7	5		
NC	9	4	7		9	6	2	1		2	2		4	5	8	5	2	4	8	8		
ND	1				4		4		1		4			1	4							
OH	3	5	8	1	12	5	2	2	2		2		2	1	8	5	3	1	7	6	1	
OK	3	3	2		2	4		2					3	3	2	2	4		2			
OR																						
PA	4	2	6		3	2	1	2	8				3	11	6	5	4	14	9	6	4	
RI	1					1		2	3				2	1		1			1	3		
SC	6	5	4	6	4	6	3	8	3	1	4		4	1	9	1	6		3	2		
SD																						
TN		1	2		2	1					2		1		2							
TX	9	9	19	11	21	17	8	10	8	2	32	1	10	11	20	6	13	3	6	12	1	
UT	4	4	2			1		1	1			1	2	1	3	1	1	2	4	5		
VT			3	1									2	2	2			1	2	2		
VA	11	11	8	2	9	9		12	1	1	5		4	11	17	5	7	3	5	7		
WA	1	2	9		9	10	3		4		1	2	5	12	6	2	1		8	2		
WV																						
WI	2							3	1		1		3		3		2			1	2	
WY			1					1	2				3	1	1			1				
Ballots Cast	418																					
Total Votes	2352																					

Write-Ins:

FL: Gregson (1)	LA: Candle (1)	MO: Gary Johnson (1)
MO: Guy McLendon (1)	MO: Hancock (1)	NJ: Gary Johnson (1)
NJ: Guy McLendon (1)	NM: Larkin (3)	OH: Linnabary (1)
PA: Jeff Wood (2)	PA: Jim Lark (1)	PA: Campbell (1)
TX: Wortham (1)	WI: Jim Lark (2)	

APPENDIX A
STATE-BY-STATE DETAIL FOR ELECTION RESULTS

Judicial Committee																							
State	Bowers	Carling	Deam	Dixon	Fulmer	Hautzinger	Johnson (TX)	Kielsky	Linnabary	Lippman	Maden	Mortenson	Moulton	Piotrowski	Robinson	Roots	Sink-Burris	Stevens	West	write-in	NOTA (write-in)	Ballots Cast	Total Votes
Total	103	109	216	115	54	99	193	107	97	17	69	53	184	37	52	95	146	28	68	28	9	365	1879
AL	4	4	5	3	4	4	4	6	4	3	4	4	7	4	4	5	3	3	4	1	3	7	83
AK			1	1																		1	2
AZ	4	3	9	6	3	6	9	17	4		1	2	9	1	3	5			5	2		19	92
AR	5	1	4			1	1	1				1					2		3			5	19
CA	5	6	15	8	6	9	12		1	4	6		15		1	6	8	1	1			24	104
CO	3		2	2	2	1	4	1	4		1		7		1	3	2		1		1	11	35
CT	2	1	1	1		2	3	1			3		2				1	1				4	18
DE																						0	0
DC																						0	0
FL	7	5	12	5	2	9	15	7	8	1	7	2	12	3	5	4	11	3	5	3	2	23	128
GA	1	1	3	1	4	1	2	4	3	1	4	2	2	1	1	2	2	1	1		0	6	37
HI	1	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1		1						2					2	14
ID		1	1	1		1											1					1	5
IL			1	2			1	1			2		2				1					3	10
IN	5	8	7	8		1	6	4	3		2		3		1	2	17		2			18	69
IA	5	2	4	4	1	2	3	3	2	1	1	1	5	1	1	1	2	4	3			6	46
KS			1	1			2	1			1		2	1	1	2	1		1			2	14
KY	2								2				1		5		1		5			5	16
LA		6	6	1		1	2				1	1	3			1	1					8	23
ME			1	1			1						1				1					1	5
MD			4	1			3	1	1		2		4				2					4	18
MA	1		1			2		3	1		3	3	3	2	1	3			2			4	25
MI	6	4	12	10	7	6	16	5	7	1	2	2	15	2	2	10	8	1	3			22	119
MN	3	1	2	1	1		2		2		1	1	2			1	1					3	18
MS		3	4		1		4	1				8	5			1	3	1	1	1		8	33
MO	1	1	4			1	3				2	1	3			1	3	1				4	21
MT	1		2				3	1								3		2				3	12
NE	2	2	5		2		4					3	3	2								5	23
NV			3	3			3						3			1	1					3	14
NH			2	1	1	1	2	2	1		2	1	2		1	2	1					5	19
NJ	1	1	3	1		1	2	1			1		1		3				1			6	16
NM		4	3	4			2	1									4			3		4	21
NY	4	13	7	1	2	6	14	6	6		4	3	11		3	6	7	2		2		18	97
NC	3	2	6	7		8	8	5	3		2		5		2	4	5	2	4	3		10	69
ND	3	3	4	4		3	4										4					4	25
OH	3	3	8	3	1	1	4	1	12			1	5		3		6		7	1		13	59
OK			4	3		3	1	1			2		1	2		3						4	20
OR																						0	0
PA	5		1	5	9	5	4	5	7	4	7	4	8	4	6	7	4		6			10	91
RI			3				1		1							1				1		3	7
SC	4	2	3	2		5	2	5	3		2	1	7	9	1	5	7		3			10	61
SD																						0	0
TN		1					1								1							1	3
TX	15	10	26	7	3	10	30	8	10	1	2	8	13	2	3	7	16	4	6	6	3	35	190
UT	2	1	5	1	1	2	1	4	3	1	1	2	5	1	1	3	1	1	1			5	37
VT			3				1				1		3									3	8
VA	3	6	13	10		3	10	9	8		1	2	13	1	2	6	8	1	3	2		15	101
WA	2	7	10	2	3	3	2	1					1				3					12	34
WV																						0	0
WI		3	3	3													3			3		3	15
WY		2												1								2	3

Write-Ins:

AL: BetteRose Ryan (1)	AZ: Ruth Bennett (1)	AZ: John Buttrick (1)	FL: Bill Weld (1)
FL: James Weeks (1)	FL: Ron Paul (1)	MS: Larry Sharpe (1)	NM: Sprinkle (3)
NY: Brett Pojunis (1)	NY: Darryl Perry (1)	NC: Sharpe (1)	NC: BetteRose Ryan (2)
OH: BetteRose Ryan (1)	RI: Jim Gray (1)	TX: BetteRose Ryan (3)	TX: Gary Johnson (NM) (2)
TX: John Bowman (1)	VA: BetteRose Ryan (2)	WI: Sprinkle (3)	

ELECTION ANOMALIES

by LNC Secretary Alicia Mattson

As I did following the 2012 and 2014 conventions, I performed a full audit of the election results for the 2016 convention. Details in an appendix to the 2014 convention minutes demonstrate that our process of manually tallying delegate ballots has not just the potential for a lot of errors, but there actually are a lot of errors. The mistakes happen because humans are working in high pressure, fast-paced situations.

Documenting our mistakes is not an effort to criticize the good-faith efforts of our convention volunteers. Knowing that these problems exist is just a necessary first step to actually finding solutions for the problems for our future conventions. Because of the 2014 report, the 2016 Bylaws and Rules Committee proposed, and the 2016 convention delegates adopted, a new rule requiring the state delegations to use ballots for all elections, requiring tellers to double-check state tallies, and requiring an on-screen review of the Secretary's spreadsheet where the state details are recorded and totaled. My knowledge of the nature of past errors inspired me to make additional conscious efforts avoid errors while compiling the state tally sheets into the final results. After my assistant read numbers to me from state tally sheets, I read them back out loud to confirm what I thought I heard and to keep my brain out of auto-pilot mode. The time pressures and loud background noise are hard to overcome.

Vote-for-One Elections

The good news is that in the 2016 vote-for-one elections (President, Vice-President, Chair, Vice-Chair, Secretary, Treasurer), I found no blatant counting errors made by delegation chairs that weren't caught onsite. As explained below there were questions about how a ballot should have been interpreted. I can't say for certain that this is an improvement over past years because these details weren't available in past years when state delegations were not required to use individual ballots, and they only turned in the tally sheet. Most states this year used the index cards provided by the tellers (though a few opted to use scraps of paper) for the individual ballots. Having pieces of paper that can be sorted into piles for each candidate, and that can be quickly double-counted by a teller seems to have generated accurate results.

There were cases where delegations initially turned in more votes than they were entitled to, but those mistakes were caught onsite and corrected before the results were announced.

Under Robert's Rules, only ballots on which the voter has indicated a preference for one of the candidates are counted towards the total votes cast for purposes of computing a majority (RONR, 11th ed., p. 415 lines 28-35). Some state chairs didn't know how to handle it when a delegate wrote "abstain" on their ballot. These should not be counted in the total number of votes/ballots cast, but even when they were, the Secretary's tally team was able to correctly exclude them when recording the delegation's totals.

Some state chairs handled it correctly when a voter wrote "not Person X" on their ballot. In that case, the voter has not indicated a preference for a specific candidate, so it is not a vote, and it is the equivalent of an abstention. In the Chair's election, one ballot in Colorado had "(just say no to)" written in small print in the top corner, and then lower on the ballot in larger print was written the name of Candidate X. The delegation chair counted it as a vote for Candidate X. I do not know if that treatment correctly reflected the intent of the voter or if any effort was made by the delegation to clarify its intent.

Some delegates just refuse to do the normal thing and write a candidate's name on their ballot. Perhaps it makes them feel clever, but it can cause confusion and waste time while tellers try to clarify the intent. The FL tally sheet in round 1 of Vice-President had one vote for an acronym not recognized by the Secretary's tally team, but the delegation chair clarified it was actually a novel way to vote for Derrick Grayson, so that's how it was counted. In the Chair's race, one delegate from Missouri turned in a folded up campaign flyer for Candidate X, and the state delegation counted it as a vote cast for Candidate X. That may have been the voter's intention, however without some sort of positive action such as the delegate writing the candidate's name, this should not be accepted as a proper vote. The delegate should have asked to cast a proper ballot.

On round 1 of voting for President, one ballot from Arizona had “Feldman” on one side in one handwriting, and “McAfee” on the other side in a different handwriting. I do not know if the delegation noticed it, or if they made an effort within the delegation to clarify the intent, but the affiliate tabulated it as a vote for Feldman.

The only known error in the vote-for-one elections was made by the Secretary on round 1 of voting for Vice-President. Four delegates cast votes for people who were verified by staff as not being eligible, so they were illegal votes. (See RONR p. 416 lines 2-5) The names were removed from the display of results, however those 4 were not added to the denominator when calculating the percentages received by each candidate. The denominator used was 869, though it should have been 873, which would have very slightly reduced the percentages each of the candidates received. As no candidate received a majority even with the smaller denominator, this did not change the outcome. These illegal votes were as follows:

GA - Milo Yiannopoulos
KY – Donald Trump
KY – Doug Stanhope
NJ – Henry George

Vote-for-Multiple Elections

The larger number of errors by delegation chairs happened during the At-Large and Judicial Committee elections, in which delegates can vote for multiple candidates. During these elections, things were very rushed, and the number of delegates in the room was dwindling. Most of the tellers had departed as well, and only two were left to assist when it came time to double-check the At-Large and Judicial Committee submissions from delegation chairs. With such time constraints and so few tellers, it was impossible for us to double-check the state tally sheets onsite in these elections. The ballots cannot just be sorted into a pile for each candidate because almost all of the ballots have multiple candidates on them, and using manual tally sheets takes more time and provides more opportunities for mistakes.

In 2014, 5 of the 40 reporting state delegations in the At-Large election (12.5%) had errors on their tally sheets. In 2014, 5 of the 33 reporting state delegations in the Judicial Committee election (15.15%) had errors on their tally sheets.

In 2016, the error rates by delegation chairs increased, possibly due to being even more pressed for time and having an even larger number of candidates on the ballot. 13 of the 46 reporting state delegations in the At-Large election (28.26%) had errors on their tally sheets. 12 of the 46 reporting state delegations in the Judicial Committee election (26.09%) had errors on their tally sheets.

None of the errors impacted the outcome of any of the elections.

The errors listed below for the At-Large election were only caught during my audit after the convention, not before results were announced at the convention. The results in the body of the minutes reflect the numbers reported onsite, not accounting for these errors below.

Because the Judicial Committee results were not completely tabulated onsite, I was able to complete the audit and correct the errors noted below before I published the election results. The results in the body of the minutes are already adjusted for these errors.

At-Large Election Errors (not caught before onsite results announced)

By Secretary's tally team:

- The Kansas tally sheet was not included in the onsite results, as it was folded up in the envelope with their individual ballots and didn't make it to the Secretary's table, leaving the impression that delegation had departed. The Kansas tally sheet included votes for: Buchman – 1, Goldstein – 1, Herd – 2, Perry – 2, Redpath – 1, Ruff – 2, Scheetz – 1, Starchild – 2, Werther – 1
- One vote for Sam Goldstein on the Rhode Island tally sheet was mistakenly attributed to Daniel Hayes.

APPENDIX B
ELECTION ANOMALIES

By Delegation Chairs:

- AL – reported 3 votes for Buchman, actual was 2
- AL – reported 8 votes for Feldman, actual was 9
- AL – reported 2 votes for Ludlow, actual was 3
- AL – reported 7 votes for Peralo, actual was 6
- AZ – reported 14 votes for Buttrick, actual was 15
- AZ – reported 5 votes for Ruff, actual was 7
- AZ – reported 4 votes for Werther, actual was 5
- AZ – crossed out 2 votes for BetteRose Ryan, should be counted even if candidate withdrew
- CA – reported 9 votes for Feldman, actual was 8
- CA – reported 5 votes for Ludlow, actual was 6
- CA – reported 10 votes for Peralo, actual was 11
- CA – reported 4 votes for Scheurer, actual was 3
- CA – reported 3 votes for Scheetz, actual was 4
- CA – reported 10 votes for Starchild, actual was 11
- CA – reported 8 votes for Werther, actual was 9
- CO – reported 7 votes for Goldstein, actual was 8
- CT – missed that one ballot had votes on back resulting in all the changes below
- CT – reported 3 votes for Redpath, actual was 4
- CT – reported 1 vote for Ruff, actual was 2
- CT – reported 0 votes for Scheurer, actual was 1
- CT – reported 1 vote for Scheetz, actual was 2
- CT – reported 3 votes for Starchild, actual was 4
- CT – reported 1 vote for Werther, actual was 2
- IN – reported 1 vote for Feldman, actual was 3
- IN – reported 12 votes for Ludlow, actual was 13
- IA – reported 2 votes for Buchman, actual was 4
- IA – reported 4 votes for Buttrick, actual was 5
- IA – reported 0 for Hayes, actual was 1
- IA – reported 0 for Peralo, actual was 1
- IA – reported 6 for Redpath, actual was 5
- MA – reported 5 votes for Peralo, actual was 4
- MA – reported 0 votes for Campbell, actual was 1
- MA – reported 0 votes for Lark, actual was 1
- MS – reported 6 ballots, actual was 7
- MS – reported 0 votes for Buttrick, actual was 1
- MS – reported 3 votes for Goldstein, actual was 4
- MS – reported 1 vote for Hayes, actual was 2
- MS – reported 2 votes for Jacobs, actual was 3
- MS – reported 0 votes for Peralo, actual was 1
- NJ – reported 0 votes for Craig, actual was 1
- NY – reported 11 votes for Perry, actual was 12
- OH – reported 12 votes for Goldstein, actual was 13
- OH – reported 3 votes for Scheurer, actual was 4
- WI – reported 3 votes for Peralo, actual was 2

Had these errors been caught onsite, the At-Large election results would have been:

Candidate	Votes	Percent
Sam Goldstein	249	59.005%
Bill Redpath	227	53.791%
Mark Feldman	177	41.943%
Darryl Perry	171	40.521%

APPENDIX B
ELECTION ANOMALIES

Starchild	158	37.441%
Daniel Hayes	150	35.545%
Jennifer Werther	143	33.886%
John Buttrick	139	32.938%
Charles Peralo	125	29.621%
Kevin Ludlow	120	28.436%
Jason Scheurer	117	27.725%
Joe Buchman	114	27.014%
Mark Hinkle	103	24.408%
Kimberly Ruff	98	23.223%
Andy Jacobs	86	20.379%
Steve Scheetz	70	16.588%
Mark Herd	64	15.166%
Roger Gary	34	8.057%
Boyd Kendall	23	5.450%
Alicia Mattson (withdrew)	6	1.422%
Jim Lark (write-in)	4	0.948%
Larkin (write-in)	3	0.711%
Gary Johnson (write-in)	2	0.474%
Guy McLendon (write-in)	2	0.474%
Jeff Wood (write-in)	2	0.474%
Campbell (write-in)	2	0.474%
BetteRose Ryan (write-in)	2	0.474%
Gregson (write-in)	1	0.237%
Candle (write-in)	1	0.237%
Linnabary (write-in)	1	0.237%
Wortham (write-in)	1	0.237%
Hancock (write-in)	1	0.237%
Craig (write-in)	1	0.237%

Judicial Committee Election Errors (all caught and corrected before results were published)

By Delegation Chairs:

- AL - delegate voted twice for Chuck Moulton on same ballot, and tally sheet counted both votes
- AL - delegate voted for write-in "Ryan", but was not listed on tally sheet
- AZ - delegate crossed out "Buttrick" but it was counted on tally sheet
- GA – reported 1 vote for Roots, actual was 2
- GA – reported 1 vote for NOTA, but that was from an "All Candidates" ballot, and our rules say that a vote for NOTA will not be counted if the same ballot contains votes for other candidates
- IA - reported 4 votes for Moulton, actual was 5
- MS - tally sheet counted a NOTA vote on the same ballot with other names
- MS – a vote for Stevens was credited to Linnabary
- MO – a vote for Moulton was credited to Mortenson
- NV – tally sheet counted a NOTA vote on the same ballot with other names
- NH – reported 6 ballots, actual was 5
- NY - delegate voted twice for Chuck Moulton on same ballot, and tally sheet counted both votes
- NC - delegate voted twice for Roger Roots on same ballot, and tally sheet counted both votes
- NC – 2 votes for Maden were credited to Mortenson
- OH – reported 2 votes for Carling, actual was 3
- OH – reported 1 vote for Maden, actual was 0
- OH – reported 6 votes for Moulton, actual was 5
- PA – reported 5 votes for Wiest, actual was 6

Conclusion

I take the time to do the audits and report these results because I think it is important that we understand the realities of how error-prone our elections are. In some cases that knowledge can help us reduce the number of similar human errors in the future, but errors will be par-for-the-course as long as humans are manually tabulating results under great time pressures and while other convention business continues in a noisy room. My preference is that these problems be addressed by electronic voting. Not only would that give us more accurate results, but it would also allow us to conduct elections in much less time. More efficient elections would also allow more delegates to participate in them before they departed the convention.

DRAFT

ENDNOTES

by LNC Secretary Alicia Mattson

These endnotes were created by the LNC Secretary who is a Professional Registered Parliamentarian. The quoted passages are from Robert's Rules of Order Newly Revised (RONR), 11th edition. It represents the opinion of the Secretary that these are relevant passages for the referenced situation.

¹ RONR p. 614 line 26 – p. 615 line 2, "Cases of contested seats in a delegation will seldom arise except in political conventions. In the rare event of a contest between two delegates or groups of delegates and serious doubt as to which is entitled to be seated, the committee should omit both from the list and report the fact of the contest to the convention as explained below. If, on the other hand, after hearing the facts, the committee thinks the contest is not justified, it should enter on the list only the names of the delegates whose claim it finds to be legitimate. The same rules apply to the more common case of delegates chosen by a local unit that is not entitled to representation or has chosen delegates in excess of its entitlement."

Also p. 616 lines 2-35, "If there is an unresolved contest between delegates, the particulars should be stated, as well as the fact that the names of the contesting or contested delegates do not appear on the roll. The committee chairman concludes the report by saying, 'On behalf of the committee, I move that the roll of delegates hereby submitted be the official roll of the voting members of the convention.' The report with the attached list of names should then be handed to the chair or to the secretary."

Unless there is debate or proposed amendment, the chair, before taking the vote on the adoption of the report, asks, "Are there any questions on the report?" If seat(s) are contested, an amendment can be offered substantially in this form: "To amend by adding 'provided that the name of George J. Morse be added to the roll of delegates as submitted, as a delegate from the state of Missouri.'" The name of the rival delegate can then be offered in a secondary amendment, for example, "to strike out 'George J. Morse' and insert 'Frank Norton.'" Whether or not a contest is reported, it is in order to move such amendments or even to move to substitute an entirely different set of delegates for any delegation in the reported list, but no such amendment is permitted to include more names than those of a single challenged delegate or delegation all of whom are challenged on the same grounds, together with any claimants involved. On an amendment proposing changes in the list of delegates, none of the delegates involved in the case can vote. Those seated by the committee, though contested in a case not yet reached, can vote on all cases except their own. On the question of adopting the Credentials Committee's report or on motions connected with its consideration, only those persons whose names are on the list of voting members reported by the committee (as this list stands after any amendment already approved by the convention) are entitled to vote."

² RONR, 11th ed., p. 75 lines 7-10, "During the meeting or series of connected meetings (called a 'session,' 8) in which the assembly has decided a question, the same or substantially the same question cannot be brought up again, except through special procedures."

Also, RONR, 11th ed., p. 336, lines 6-16, "Renewal of motions is limited by the basic principle that an assembly cannot be asked to decide the same, or substantially the same, question twice during one session—except through a motion to reconsider a vote (37) or a motion to rescind an action (35), or in connection with amending something already adopted (see also pp. 74–75). A previously considered motion may become a substantially different question through a significant change in the wording or because of a difference in the time or circumstances in which it is proposed, and such a motion may thus be in order when it could not otherwise be renewed."

³ RONR, 11th ed., p. 349 lines 8 – 19, "When the chair has called a meeting to order after finding that a quorum is present, the continued presence of a quorum is presumed unless the chair or a member notices that a quorum is no longer present. If the chair notices the absence of a quorum, it is his duty to declare the fact, at least before taking any vote or stating the question on any new motion—which he can no longer do except in connection with the permissible proceedings related to the absence of a quorum,

as explained above. Any member noticing the apparent absence of a quorum can make a point of order to that effect at any time so long as he does not interrupt a person who is speaking.”

Also p. 422 lines 9-15, “In roll-call voting, a record of how each member voted, as well as the result of the vote, should be entered in full in the journal or minutes. If those responding to the roll call do not total a sufficient number to constitute a quorum, the chair must direct the secretary to enter the names of enough members who are present but not voting to reflect the attendance of a quorum during the vote.”

⁴ RONR, 11th ed., p. 411 lines 12-14 indicates that when counting a rising vote, “Those in the affirmative are always counted first. In all but small assemblies, the doors should be closed and no one should enter or leave the hall while a count is being taken.”

⁵ RONR, 11th ed., p. 19, lines 3-15, “In some organizations, a particular practice may sometimes come to be followed as a matter of established custom so that it is treated practically as if it were prescribed by a rule. If there is no contrary provision in the parliamentary authority or written rules of the organization, the established custom should be adhered to unless the assembly, by a majority vote, agrees in a particular instance to do otherwise. However, if a customary practice is or becomes in conflict with the parliamentary authority or any written rule, and a Point of Order (23) citing the conflict is raised at any time, the custom falls to the ground, and the conflicting provision in the parliamentary authority or written rule must thereafter be complied with.”

⁶ RONR, 11th ed., p. 280, lines 10-15, “Whenever a member doubts the result of a voice (viva-voce) vote or a vote by show of hands—either because the result appears close or because he doubts that a representative number of the members present have voted—he can call for a Division of the Assembly, thereby requiring the vote to be taken again by rising.”

⁷ RONR, 11th ed., p. 59, lines 17-24, “Secondary motions may be seen as related to the following fundamental principle of parliamentary law: Only one question can be considered at a time; once a motion is before the assembly, it must be adopted or rejected by a vote, or the assembly must take action disposing of the question in some other way, before any other business (except certain matters called ‘privileged questions’) can be introduced. By this principle, a main motion can be made only when no other motion is pending.”

Also p. 430, lines 4-6, “A nomination is, in effect, a proposal to fill the blank in an assumed motion ‘that _____ be elected’ to the specified position.”

Also p. 260, lines 32-35, “[Suspend the Rules] Can be made at any time that no question is pending. When business is pending, Suspend the Rules takes precedence over any motion if it is for a purpose connected with that motion.” See also p. 263-265.

Also p. 408, lines 9-13, “Interruptions during the taking of a vote are permitted only before any member has actually voted, unless, as sometimes occurs in ballot voting, other business is being transacted during voting or tabulating.”

⁸ LP Convention Rule 7.3, “When all the delegations have submitted their votes, the Secretary shall declare the voting closed.”

⁹ RONR, 11th ed, p. 407 lines 1-4, “It is a fundamental principle of parliamentary law that each person who is a member of a deliberative assembly is entitled to one—and only one—vote on a question.”

Also p. 260, lines 19-26, "When an assembly wishes to do something during a meeting that it cannot do without violating one or more of its regular rules, it can adopt a motion to Suspend the Rules interfering with the proposed action—provided that the proposal is not in conflict with the organization's bylaws (or constitution), with local, state, or national law prescribing procedural rules applicable to the organization or assembly, or with a fundamental principle of parliamentary law."

Also p. 263, lines 15-18 and 24-28, "Rules which embody fundamental principles of parliamentary law, such as the rule that allows only one question to be considered at a time (p. 59), cannot be suspended, even by a unanimous vote... Likewise, since it is a fundamental principle that each member of a deliberative assembly is entitled to one—and only one—vote on a question, the rules may not be suspended so as to authorize cumulative voting (pp. 443–44)."

Also p. 19, lines 3-15, "In some organizations, a particular practice may sometimes come to be followed as a matter of established custom so that it is treated practically as if it were prescribed by a rule. If there is no contrary provision in the parliamentary authority or written rules of the organization, the established custom should be adhered to unless the assembly, by a majority vote, agrees in a particular instance to do otherwise. However, if a customary practice is or becomes in conflict with the parliamentary authority or any written rule, and a Point of Order (23) citing the conflict is raised at any time, the custom falls to the ground, and the conflicting provision in the parliamentary authority or written rule must thereafter be complied with. If it is then desired to follow the former practice, a special rule of order (or, in appropriate circumstances, a standing rule or a bylaw provision) can be added or amended to incorporate it."

¹⁰ RONR, 11th ed., p. 263, lines 1-7, "Rules contained in the bylaws (or constitution) cannot be suspended—no matter how large the vote in favor of doing so or how inconvenient the rule in question may be—unless the particular rule specifically provides for its own suspension, or unless the rule properly is in the nature of a rule of order as described on page 17, lines 22–25."

Also p. 263 line 29 – p. 264 line 5, "Rules protecting absentees cannot be suspended, even by unanimous consent or an actual unanimous vote, because the absentees do not consent to such suspension. For example, the rules requiring the presence of a quorum, restricting business transacted at a special meeting to that mentioned in the call of the meeting, and requiring previous notice of a proposed amendment to the bylaws protect absentees, if there are any, and cannot be suspended when any member is absent."

¹¹ RONR, 11th ed., p. 262, lines 8-17, "When the purpose of a motion to Suspend the Rules is to permit the making of another motion, and the adoption of the first motion would obviously be followed by adoption of the second, the two motions can be combined, as in "to suspend the rules and take from the table (34) the question relating to ...". The foregoing is an exception to the general rule that no member can make two motions at the same time except with the consent of the assembly—unanimous consent being required if the two motions are unrelated (see also pp. 110, 274–75)."

¹² RONR, 11th ed., p. 394, lines 12-22, "During debate, during remarks by the presiding officer to the assembly, and during voting, no member should be permitted to disturb the assembly by whispering, walking across the floor, or in any other way. The key words here are disturb the assembly. This rule does not mean, therefore, that members can never whisper, or walk from one place to another in the hall during the deliberations of the assembly. At large meetings it would be impossible to enforce such a rule. However, the presiding officer should watch that such activity does not disturb the meeting or hamper the transaction of business."

¹³ Though the delegate referenced Section 73, given the circumstances, he likely intended to cite Section 63. RONR, 11th ed., Section 63 (in Chapter 20) is found spanning p. 654-669, and it addresses procedures for discipline of a member for improper conduct.

Also in Chapter 20, p. 643 line 6 – 15, “Although ordinary societies seldom have occasion to discipline members, an organization or assembly has the ultimate right to make and enforce its own rules, and to require that its members refrain from conduct injurious to the organization or its purposes. No one should be allowed to remain a member if his retention will do this kind of harm. Punishments that a society can impose generally fall under the headings of censure,* fine (if authorized in the bylaws), suspension, or expulsion. The extreme penalty that an organization or society can impose on a member is expulsion.”

Also in Chapter 20, p. 646 lines 26 – 28 regarding offenses by members of the assembly during the meeting, “Although the chair has no authority to impose a penalty or to order the offending member removed from the hall, the assembly has that power.”

¹⁴ RONR, 11th ed., p. 347 line 21 – p. 348 line 16, “In the absence of a quorum, any business transacted (except for the procedural actions noted in the next paragraph) is null and void... Even in the absence of a quorum, the assembly may fix the time to which to adjourn (22), adjourn (21), recess (20), or take measures to obtain a quorum. Subsidiary and incidental motions, questions of privilege, motions to Raise a Question of Privilege or Call for the Orders of the Day, and other motions may also be considered if they are related to these motions or to the conduct of the meeting while it remains without a quorum... The prohibition against transacting business in the absence of a quorum cannot be waived even by unanimous consent, and a notice (pp. 121–24) cannot be validly given.”

¹⁵ RONR, 11th ed., p. 25 lines 9–11, “When the time of a meeting has arrived, the presiding officer opens it, after he has determined that a quorum is present, by calling the meeting to order.”

Also p. 349 lines 8–16, “When the chair has called a meeting to order after finding that a quorum is present, the continued presence of a quorum is presumed unless the chair or a member notices that a quorum is no longer present. If the chair notices the absence of a quorum, it is his duty to declare the fact, at least before taking any vote or stating the question on any new motion—which he can no longer do except in connection with the permissible proceedings related to the absence of a quorum, as explained above.”

¹⁶ RONR, 11th ed., p. 263 line 29 – p. 264 line 5, “Rules protecting absentees cannot be suspended, even by unanimous consent or an actual unanimous vote, because the absentees do not consent to such suspension. For example, the rules requiring the presence of a quorum, restricting business transacted at a special meeting to that mentioned in the call of the meeting, and requiring previous notice of a proposed amendment to the bylaws protect absentees, if there are any, and cannot be suspended when any member is absent.”

¹⁷ RONR, 11th ed., p. 405, lines 2-7, “A plurality that is not a majority never chooses a proposition or elects anyone to office except by virtue of a special rule previously adopted. If such a rule is to apply to the election of officers, it must be prescribed in the bylaws. A rule that a plurality shall elect is unlikely to be in the best interests of the average organization.”

¹⁸ RONR, 11th ed., p. 223, line 33 – 35, “To call for the orders of the day, a member rises and, addressing the chair without waiting for recognition, says...”

¹⁹ RONR, 11th ed., p. 643, lines 6-11, “Although ordinary societies seldom have occasion to discipline members, an organization or assembly has the ultimate right to make and enforce its own rules, and to require that its members refrain from conduct injurious to the organization or its purposes. No one should be allowed to remain a member if his retention will do this kind of harm.”