

SECRETARY'S REPORT – LNC MEETING MARCH 9–10, 2019

LINK FOR ONENOTE NOTEBOOK FOR THIS MEETING: <https://tinyurl.com/onenoteMar2019>

Position Duties

Bylaws Article 6 – OFFICERS

5. The Secretary shall be the recording officer of the Party and shall perform such duties as are assigned by the Chair or the National Committee. The Secretary shall attend all meetings of the National Committee and all Party Conventions and shall act as Secretary thereof, keeping such minutes and records as necessary.

Further specific responsibilities are assigned by the following:

- Bylaws Articles 5.2; 7.2.c; 7.14; 8.3; 10.4.b; 10.9 (if Convention Secretary); 13.
- Convention Rules 2.2; 3.1; 3.2; 3.3; 5.1.e-f; 7.3; 8.1.b; 8.2.b; 10.
- Policy Manual Special Rules of Order 1.01.4; 1.02.5; 1.02.6; 7.g; 7.m; 7.o; 7.p; 1.04.1.
- Policy Manual Standing Rules 2.01.2; 2.06.5; 2.07.2; 2.07.3; 2.07.4; 3.05.2; 3.05.3.

Status of Minutes Since Last Report

December 1-2, 2018 LNC Meeting

Draft minutes have been posted to the LNC Business List and undergone multiple revisions. Mr. Bishop-Henchman provided language to cure his objection that has been provided for review.

The current proposed draft (V.8) can be viewed in the OneNote notebook prepared for this meeting.

January 6, 2019 Special LNC Meeting

Minutes were auto-approved on February 13, 2019 and posted to the Party website.

These minutes can be viewed here: https://www.lp.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/2019_01_06_LNC_Minutes-approved.pdf

February 19, 2019 Executive Committee Meeting

Draft minutes have been posted to the LNC Business List for review with approval of these minutes to be moved during this report presentation.

The current proposed draft can be viewed in the OneNote notebook prepared for this meeting.

Both Dr. Lark and Mr. Bishop-Henchman were the winners of the Easter Egg hunt for the December minutes. Mr. Lyons was the winner of the Easter Egg hunt for the January minutes.

Motions

- *Move to approve the draft minutes, version 8, for the December 1-2, 2018 LNC meeting.*
- *Move to approve the draft minutes, version 1, for the February 19, 2019 Executive Committee meeting.*

Documents Updated

- Policy Manual** ○ Made revisions (see Ballots 181201-1, 190106-3, 190106-5)
- Conflicts of Interest** ○ Potential conflicts were updated at the previous meeting. A current list was distributed for review and update at this meeting.

Documents Created

The new procedure of creating a OneNote notebook for each meeting has been successful and improved upon for each meeting. Although the notebook was primarily intended to be for the use of LNC members, it has proven to be of assistance to Party members who are following the meeting live or reviewing afterwards. These notebooks will be preserved for the historical archives.

Additionally, I have been preserving the recordings for each meeting and am creating appropriate LPedia entries to continue to assist to preserve our institutional memory. Example links and articles will be provided with my next report. I recommend this be a required procedure for my successors and that similar procedures be considered for LNC members and committees. Volunteers will eventually create archives for past LNC meetings to the extent possible.

With the assistance of volunteer Angela Plummer (CO), I created an archive of current state party bylaws including information on affiliate contacts, voting registration, membership requirements, and delegate selection processes which can be viewed here: <https://tinyurl.com/lncbylawsarchive>. There are a few blanks remaining to be filled, and I will be reviewing the archive recently sent by Ms. Mattson to incorporate any missing information contained therein.

LNC Membership Changes Since December Meeting

Region 1 Alternate Craig Bowden resigned on February 23, 2019 creating a vacancy. Regional Representative Richard Longstreth is working with the Region 1 State Chairs to fill this vacancy pursuant to their regional agreement.

Committee Membership Changes Since December Meeting

I was notified that Julie Fox was elected chair of the Audit Committee and directed staff to update the website accordingly. Since the submission of V.1 of this report, Mr. Sarwark notified the LNC of the appointments to the IT Committee (Benjamin Bachrach, Devin Balkind, Juanita Billings, Ryan Thomas Graham, Ken Moellman). I have directed staff to update the website accordingly. Ms. Van Horn is notifying those selected of their appointments as well as the remaining applicants to encourage them to volunteer and thank them for their interest.

Committee Appointments Remaining

- **Affiliate Support Committee:** LNC Chair to appoint committee chair who then selects three (3) regional representatives or alternates.
- **Convention Voting Process Committee:** The committee shall comprise nine (9) members appointed by the LNC with an interim Chair appointed by the LNC Chair. These appointments were the subject of Ballot 190214-2 and subject to a challenge on the results to be resolved this meeting (see emails of Mr. Bishop-Henchman and Ms. Mattson dated February 26, 2019). In anticipation of a likely re-vote, printed ballots have been prepared.
- **Historical Preservation Committee:** Up to two (2) additional members to be appointed by the committee chair. The committee has solicited applications and contacted multiple applicants for additional information. No decision has been made.
- **Membership Support Committee:** The committee shall comprise nine (9) members appointed by the LNC with an interim Chair appointed by the LNC Chair. These appointments were the subject of Ballot 190214-1 and subject to a challenge on the results to be resolved this meeting (see emails of Mr. Bishop-Henchman and Ms. Mattson dated February 26, 2019). In anticipation of a likely re-vote, printed ballots have been prepared.

Other Activities

- Submitted articles for LP News.
- Continued contact with state affiliate chairs and members to offer assistance.
- Produced regular "How to Get Involved" videos for that national Facebook page.
- Sent thank you emails to member attendees at the December meeting.
- Recruited committee applicants to join the national party and communicated with applicants about the status of their applications.
- Nearing completion of Parliamentary Procedure course via distance learning offered by the University of Wisconsin.

Teleconferencing and Streaming Software

Research has continued with a goal of paring down the paid subscription services. Further, future Executive Committee teleconferences will be conducted via Zoom.

Pending Issues

At the September meeting, motions to amend the Policy Manual regarding the APRC and a records hand-off procedure were tabled and postponed indefinitely (see Ballots 180930-6 and 180930-15 respectively). Dr. Lark indicated a potential interest in working on proposed re-worked language with Ms. Harlos. Ms. Harlos noted multiple stylistic inconsistencies in the Policy Manual that should be smoothed out. Proposals on these

items are planned to be offered at this meeting with wording to be submitted via the LNC Business List prior to the meeting.

Upcoming Critical Dates

As the 2020 national convention approaches, there are multiple time-sensitive tasks to be undertaken by the Secretary as well as educational materials to be prepared and sent to the state chairs. The next relevant date appears as follows:

Bylaws Article 10.4

4. *Delegate Allocation:*

a. In order to be counted for delegate allocation, sustaining membership applications must be sent to the National Headquarters by either the individual member or the affiliate party and received or postmarked no later than the last day of the seventh month prior to the Regular Convention.

This would be 10/31/19.

I solicit the counsel and mentorship of my predecessor Ms. Mattson regarding dates and tasks to undertake regarding convention preparation.

Email Ballots

The following email ballots were completed since the December 1-2, 2018 LNC meeting.¹

**Ballot 190203-1
Concluded 2/10/19**

The following resolution was moved:

WHEREAS, the Libertarian Party believes that the only proper role of law is in the protection of the natural rights of individuals from the initiation of force or fraud;

WHEREAS, no individual has a natural right to prohibit consensual visitation to or consensual habitation on the private property of another individual;

WHEREAS, the Libertarian Party believes that eminent domain is a violation of private property rights;

WHEREAS, we affirm the right of individuals to set whatever standards they wish for entry onto their own private property but not that owned by others;

WHEREAS, we believe that all individuals have the same natural rights regardless of their citizenship;

WHEREAS, the Libertarian Party holds that any concerns related to the border, valid or otherwise, are better addressed by removing the root causes of such concerns. Actions such as ending the War on Drugs, decriminalization of sex work, ending the welfare state, and allowing free trade would not only address those concerns, but do so in a budget positive way rather than costing billions;

WHEREAS, the Libertarian Party acknowledges that economic freedom demands the unrestricted movement of human as well as financial capital across national borders: *NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED* that the Libertarian Party condemns and opposes efforts to build a governmental border wall, be it through congress or gross abuse of authority in an ill-founded declaration of emergency.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Libertarian Party supports the natural right of freedom of movement of all peaceful people, for any reason, subject only to rights of other individuals to control their own privately-owned property.

¹ Since 2018, email motions and main substantive motions made during LNC and Executive Committee meetings have been combined into one tally sheet located at: <https://tinyurl.com/lncvotes2019>

Results:

Sponsors: Harlos, Longstreth, Merced, Phillips

Voting "aye": Bilyeu, Bishop-Henchman, Goldstein, Harlos, Hewitt, Lark, Longstreth, Merced, Phillips, Redpath

Voting "nay": Mattson, Smith, Van Horn

Express Abstention: O'Donnell

No Vote Cast: Hagan, Nekhaila/Lee, Sarwark

With a final vote tally of 10-3-4 the motion PASSED.

The vote tally record can be viewed here: <https://tinyurl.com/ballot190203-1>

**Ballot 190214-1
Concluded 2/21/19**

Elect nine (9) members of the Membership Support Committee.²

Results:

Results presently under challenge and not officially released.³

The vote tally record can be viewed here: <https://tinyurl.com/ballot190214-1>

**Ballot 190214-2
Concluded 2/21/19**

Elect nine (9) members of the Convention Voting Process Committee.⁴

Results:

Results presently under challenge and not officially released.⁵

The vote tally record can be viewed here: <https://tinyurl.com/ballot190214-2>

**Ballot 190214-3
Concluded 2/21/19**

Shall the ruling of the Chair on Ballot 190203-1 [Immigration Resolution] that "no" vote of Regional Alternate Lyons should be counted after Regional Representative O'Donnell registered an unqualified express abstention with the result that the Resolution would change from PASS to FAIL be sustained?

Results:

Sponsors: Bilyeu, Goldstein, Harlos, Longstreth, Mattson

Voting "aye": Bishop-Henchman, Lyons, Phillips, Van Horn

Voting "nay": Bilyeu, Goldstein, Hagan, Harlos, Lark, Longstreth, Mattson, Olsen, Smith

Express Abstention: Merced

No Vote Cast: Nekhaila/Lee, Redpath, Sarwark

With a final vote tally of 4-9-4 the ruling of the Chair is OVERTURNED.

The vote tally record can be viewed here: <https://tinyurl.com/ballot190214-3>⁶

Conventions and Membership Drives

² See Ballot 180929-17 for creation of the Membership Support Committee and Ballot 181201-2 for the determination of the voting method.

³ I will include data print-outs in the OneNote notebook of what the results would have been using Approval Voting, Coombes IRV, Meek STV, Green Party of California STV, and Condorcet Borda in addition to the Scottish STV actually used. Descriptive explanatory summaries of all of the available voting methods in the OpaVote software will also be provided.

⁴ See Ballot 180930-7 for creation of the Convention Voting Process Committee and Ballot 181201-2 for the determination of the voting method.

⁵ Ibid., footnote 3.

⁶ Notice has been given of the intent to introduce a Motion to Reconsider Ballot 190203-1 at this meeting.

I am scheduled to appear at the following conventions as a featured speaker and will also conduct national membership drives:⁷

- Arkansas
- California
- Colorado
- Florida
- Maine⁸

Respectfully Submitted,

Caryn Ann Harlos

LNC Secretary ~ Secretary@LP.org ~ 561.523.2250

⁷ Due to a miscommunication, I will not be appearing at the Missouri convention as previously announced.

⁸ This event is not a convention but a training seminar to take place in October.

APPENDIX A – MEMBERSHIP SUPPORT COMMITTEE BALLOT TALLY

ELECT MEMBERSHIP SUPPORT COMMITTEE																	
EMAIL BALLOT NUMBER: 190214-1 12 Votes																	
VIA OPA-VOTE																	
VOTING METHOD: SCOTTISH RCV -																	
CANDIDATE	Bilveu/Adams	Bishop-Henchman	Goldstein	Hagan	Harios	Hewitt/Olsen	Lark/Hoqarh	Longstreth	Mattson	Merced	Nekhalla/Lee	O'Donnell	Phillip/Anderson	Redpath	Sarwark	Smith	Van Horn/Nanna
Matthew Abel								4									
Dawit Amdework																	
Tyler Bergenquast	5				9											7	
Paul Bilyeu	1	8					6	7		7	6	3			8	4	9
Brandon Bobbit									13								7
Bryan Bombardier			4						11								4
Brandon Campbell	8																
PJ Cappelli									16		5					5	
Brandon Collins												8					
Steve Dasbach		3		4			1		1	6	7				7	1	6
Fernando Davis	6								15		8				8		
Omar Elkhatib																	
Austin Elkins																	
Jennifer Flower							9		14							8	
Kenneth Fuller																	
Shoval Grunberger																	
James Harrison	4																
Cecil Ince					6			6									
Kenny Kelly												1					
Marc Lazerow		6							9								
Kylee Loro									10								
Jeff Lyons		2					4	8	2	5	2	4			2	3	2
Daniel Marston																	
Joseph McMillen																	
Alex Merced		1		1		3	9	5	1	3	5				3	2	
Jennifer Moore		7		7		2	4	4	4	6					5	3	
Kevin Moore						7		7								6	
Mayna Myers								1			9				9		
Christopher Olenski																	
James Olivi								2									
Francisco Olvera									12		10				10		
Sean Parr											11				11		
Omar Recuero				3											4		5
Christopher Robinson	3						8		3	9	4						
Austin Sachs																	
Mike Saibba											8						
Valerie Sarwark	2	5		2			5	3		2	1	2			1		1
Ashley Shade				5							3		7			9	
Rachaud Smith																	
Sharon Smith									17								
Ethan Steele									6								
Kristopher Thomas	7								8								
Johnny Walker				8				5									
Nathaniel Wallace																	
Kevin Warmhold		9															8
NOTA																	

Secretary's Notes: Hagan was not able to copy his ballot so his column will be filled in later. Goldstein voted but did not post his ballot, and this will need to be filled in later. Although Lark and Smith stated on the list that they voted, they did not vote in the software and only recorded votes on the list. **Unofficial results:** Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, Valerie Sarwark, Ashley Shade **The results are the subject of a challenge to be resolved at the March LNC meeting.**

APPENDIX B – CONVENTION VOTING PROCESS COMMITTEE BALLOT TALLY

CONVENTION VOTING PROCESS COMMITTEE																	
BALLOT NUMBER: 190214-2																	
VIA OPA-VOTE																	
METHOD: SCOTTISH STV - PICK UP TO NINE																	
CANDIDATE	Blyeu/Adams	Bishop-Henchman	Goldstein	Hagan	Harlos	Hewitt/Olsen	Lark/Hogarth	Longstreth	Mattson	Merced	Nekhalla/Lee	O'Donnell	Phillips	Redpath	Sarwark	Smith	Van Horn/Nanna
Matthew Abel																	
James Aragon		7							2								8
Paul Blyeu	4				8			6		7		7	7	10			
Joseph Bishop-Henchman		1			9		4	9	4	1		5	3	4	1	7	1
Bryan Bombardier									9								
Michael Borden																4	
Brandon Collins																	
Pat Dixon	1	9			5		3			2				5	6		3
Jeff Douglas																1	
Brian Draper									8								
Austin Elkins																	
Richard Fast	3												1		8		
Tim Ferreira					6											2	
Daniel Fishman		3			2		6		6	5		2	6	2		5	4
Kenneth Fuller							8							7	9		
June Genis									13			3					
Laurence Gillis																	
Paul Grindle										8							
Shoval Grunberger																	
Susan Hogarth		5			7		5	7		9		8	5	9	7	6	6
Robert Imhoff									5						3		
Cecil Ince													9				
Dan Karlan					3		1		1					8	2		
Kenny Kelly												4					
Marc Lazerow									7								9
Chris Luchini		8					9	1							4		
Jeff Lyons		2						8	3			6	4	3			5
Matt McCary																	
Michael Nelson									20						5		
James Ogle																	
Francisco Olvera										11							
James Olvi								2		12							
Greg Pierce								3									
Angela Plummer					4			4									
Bill Redpath					1		2				4	1	2	1			2
Christopher Robinson	2		6													9	
Austin Sachs																	
Ashley Shade										3							9
Frederick Snoy								5									
Thomas Soules																	
Kristopher Thomas																	
David Valente		4					7			6			8	8		3	7
Kevin Warmhold																	
NOTA																	

Secretary's notes: Francisco Olvera was inadvertently not included in the index of applicants and thus not on the ballot. This will be corrected in any re-vote. Hagan was not able to copy his ballot so his column will be filled in later. Goldstein voted but did not post his ballot, and this will need to be filled in later. Although Lark and Smith stated on the list that they voted, they did not vote in the software and only recorded votes on the list. **Unofficial results:** Joseph Bishop-Henchman, Pat Dixon, Richard Fast, Daniel Fishman, Laurence Gillis, Dan Karlan, Chris Luchini, Jeff Lyons, Bill Redpath **The results are the subject of a challenge to be resolved at the March LNC meeting.**

APPENDIX C – COMMENTARY ON ALTERNATIVE VOTING METHODS

A lot of lessons (good and bad, but both overall) were learned in the two “test” elections experimenting with alternative voting methods. The official method used was Scottish STV. In order to see how different methods would yield different results, I ran the same ballots through the following additional methods: *Approval Voting*, *Coombs Method*, *Green Party (California) STV*, *Meeks STV*, and *Condorcet Borda*; and noted the major similarities in each of them with who was elected in each of them. The potential winners for each race were nine (9), and in each instance there were four (4) common winners in all of the respective methods.

CONVENTION VOTING PROCESS COMMITTEE

Approval ¹¹	Bilyeu, Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fishman, Hogarth, Karlan, Lyons, Redpath, Valente
Scottish STV ¹²	Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fast, Fishman, Gillis, Karlan, Luchini, Lyons, Redpath
Coombs ¹³	Bilyeu, Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Karlan, Redpath
Green Party STV ¹⁴	Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fast, Fishman, Hogarth, Karlan, Lyons, Redpath
Meeks STV ¹⁵	Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fast, Fishman, Gillis, Karlan, Luchini, Lyons, Redpath
Condorcet Borda ¹⁶	Bilyeu, Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fishman, Hogarth, Karlan, Lyons, Redpath, Valente

Elected in all 6: Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Karlan, Redpath
Elected in at least 5 of 6: Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fishman, Lyons
Elected in at least 4 of 6: Bishop-Henchman, Dixon, Fishman, Lyons

MEMBERSHIP SUPPORT COMMITTEE

Approval	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Davis, Lyons, Merced, J. Moore, Recuero, Sarwark, Walker
Scottish STV	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Kelly, Lyons, Merced, Myers, Recuero, Sarwark, Shade
Coombs	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Merced, Sarwark
Green Party STV	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Kelly, Lyons, Merced, J. Moore, Recuero, Sarwark
Meeks STV	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Kelly, Lyons, Merced, J. Moore, Myers, Parr, Sarwark
Condorcet Borda	Bilyeu, Dasbach, Davis, Lyons, Merced, J. Moore, Recuero, Sarwark, Walker

Elected in all 6: Bilyeu, Dasbach, Merced, Sarwark
Elected in at least 5 of 6: Bilyeu, Dasbach, Lyons, Merced, Sarwark
Elected in at least 4 of 6: Bilyeu, Dasbach, Lyons, Merced, J. Moore, Recuero, Sarwark

I spoke OpaVote about having multi-seat elections that required at least a majority vote rather than a plurality and received this response:

People do this by filling the positions sequentially: <https://blog.opavote.com/2017/08/implementing-waterfall-elections-with.html>

¹¹ <https://www.opavote.com/methods/approval-voting>

¹² <https://www.opavote.com/methods/single-transferable-vote#scottish-stv>

¹³ <https://www.opavote.com/methods/other#coombs-method>

¹⁴ Need to contact OpaVote to publish a description of this method

¹⁵ <https://www.opavote.com/methods/single-transferable-vote#meek-stv>

¹⁶ <https://www.opavote.com/methods/condorcet-voting> and <https://blog.opavote.com/2017/03/why-we-love-borda-count.html>

Several members of the LNC provided insightful analysis reproduced below.

From Ms. Mattson:

I have a number of comments I wish to make about the Scottish STV voting system, but I don't have time to write it all up this evening. I will start with these comments and add more details to these thoughts later.

It is one thing to read the theory and rules for a voting system on a webpage, but it's another thing to print out the paper ballots and enact the process yourself to see the effects of each step. Last night, I took the 7 ballots cast up to that point, printed them out on paper, and put them in piles on the floor to manually experience how it works.

It didn't take long before my eyes got wide. Then a little later my jaw dropped as I realized more and more implications of the process. When I was done, I paced around the living room in a bit of a rant as I put my realizations into words.

Clearly, this voting system was envisioned for situations in which the number of ballots being cast VASTLY outnumbers (by orders of magnitude) both the number of seats being filled and also the number of candidates.

In our case, however, if everyone had voted it would have been 17 ballots cast to choose from more than 40 candidates to fill 9 seats. I only saw ballots from 12 people on one election and 13 on the other, making the ratios even worse. This seems to be in the range of worst-case-scenario for this voting system.

With these ratios, the process devolves into essentially a casino game of chance necessitating random candidate eliminations early in the process. After the first round of vote distributions, we might as well just tell the candidates to play Russian roulette...or for fewer dead bodies we could just draw names out of a hat.

If I correctly understand the process, then it's mathematically impossible for the number of ballots cast in these two elections to elect more than 6 candidates to each committee. Looking at the vote distribution, we'll elect at least 3 but no more than 6, depending on the outcome of some random selections, so we're in for re-balloting anyway.

One thing that I found particularly annoying about the way that OpaVote reports the results is that it does not report the actual number of votes attributed to each candidate in each round. Instead it shows us a percent, though percentages have nothing to do with who is elected or eliminated. If someone has a whole number of votes, those bars on the chart meet up with the vertical lines, but otherwise it doesn't tell you that in Round 3, Jeff Lyons had 1.8333 votes, and that Parr and Shade had 0.33333 votes...instead it says Lyons had 14.1% of the vote and Parr/Shade had 2.6%. What do the percentages matter when the goal is to get to 2 votes?

I was under the impression that with 13 ballots choosing 9 seats from 46 candidates, the "threshold" of 2 meant that only 6 could be elected. So I was surprised when the system listed 9 candidates elected.

On this OpaVote page of a "plain English" description of Scottish STV:
<https://blog.opavote.com/2016/11/plain-english-explanation-of-scottish.html>

It says things like, "All STV methods have a quota or winning threshold." Once the "winning threshold" is determined to be 2, it sounds like one needs at least 2 votes to be elected. There was another quote that I don't see now (maybe it was on the generic STV page rather than the Scottish variant) which referred to repeating the process until there are X candidates who have exceeded the threshold.

Now I'm noticing in the final paragraph of the Scottish STV page the following, "If there are N positions being filled, then the election is over when N candidates have reached the quota or when only N+1 candidates remain (the winners being the N candidates with the highest numbers of votes)." So even the low threshold of 2 is not required for election.

Once there are only 10 candidates left, the top 9 are elected.

From Mr. Hagan:

This is a good learning experiment. I am wondering if one of the problems is that we are a relatively small groups electing a relatively large group. Scottish STV uses the Integer function to determine the threshold. It probably works much better with thousands of voters electing four or five positions. Rounding up to a whole number for the threshold instead of using a fractional threshold means that at the last round candidates below the threshold still get elected. In our vote, four candidates reached the threshold of at least 2 votes and the rest of the winners were still below the threshold at the last round. We also had candidates tied and the program selecting one at random to eliminate. Using a method with a fractional threshold gets rid of the random tie-breakers and has all of the winning candidates reaching the threshold.

OpaVote allows us to recount with different methods, so I tried it with the Membership Support Committee vote.

Scottish STV: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, Valerie Sarwark, and Ashely Shade

Meek STV with Whole threshold: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Jennifer Moore, Mayna Myers, Sean Parr, and Valerie Sarwark

Meek STV with Fractional threshold: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Jennifer Moore, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, and Valerie Sarwark

ERS97 STV: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Jennifer Moore, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, and Valerie Sarwark

Warren STV with Fractional threshold: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Jennifer Moore, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, and Valerie Sarwark

N. Ireland STV: Paul Bilyeu, Steve Dasbach, Kenny Kelly, Jeff Lyons, Alex Merced, Mayna Myers, Omar Recuero, Valerie Sarwark, and Ashely Shade

Bilyeu, Dasbach, Merced, and Sarwark got enough first-place votes to win in the first round with all methods. Lyons, Kelly, and Myers are favorites who win with the STV methods. The differences come down Jennifer Moore, Sean Parr, Omar Recuero, and Ashely Shade. I haven't Lyons, Kelly, and Myers are favorites who win with the STV methods.

From Mr. Bishop-Henchman:

I also just played the results Ms. Harlos sent out and came to the same fascinating (to me, at least) realization. Ranked choice voting works great if 800 people are choosing 5 or 9 spots; when it's 12 or 13 people choosing 9 spots, there are odd results. Especially if each voter is limited to nine choices, resulting in premature exhaustion of several ballots.

Here are the final results with number of distributed votes:

APPENDIX C – COMMENTARY ON ALTERNATIVE VOTING METHODS

V. Sarwark - 2.00
P. Bilyeu - 2.00
Merced - 2.00
Dasbach - 2.00
Lyons - 1.91
Kelly - 1.00
Shade - 0.66
Recuero - 0.50
Myers - 0.50

Forget majority - three of our final 9 were elected with less than one vote after fully distributing everything. As the report indicated, 37 of the 40 rounds broke a tie by random, including on the final round. With that many random choices, we could probably re-run the results and get a different final three members each time. (One reading of Scottish STV is that while it doesn't require a majority it still requires hitting the threshold of 2, and only four people did so.)

I compared it to approval voting (the usual method we have used for filling vacancies), assuming (probably incorrectly) that everyone would have voted for the same people:

Valerie Sarwark 12
Paul Bilyeu 11
Alex Merced 11
Jeff Lyons 10
Steve Dasbach 9
Jennifer Moore 9 (not elected)
Omar Recuero 7
Fernando Davis 5 (not elected)
Johnny Walker 5 (not elected)

Tyler Bargaquast 4
Brandon Bobbit 4
Bryan Bombardier 4
PJ Capelli 4
Jennifer Flower 4
Cecil Ince 4
Kenny Kelly 4 (elected)
Mayna Myers 4 (elected)
Kevin Warmhold 4
Marc Lazerow 3
Kevin Moore 3
James Olivi 3
Fransisco Olvera 3
Sean Parr 3
Ashely Shade 3 (elected)
Sharon Smith 3

The starkest differences between the two voting methods are that J. Moore appeared on 9 of our 13 ballots, on all but one in the top six, but was not elected, while Shade (appearing on just three ballots as 4th, 5th, and 7th choices), was elected by random coin flip ahead of over a dozen other people who appeared on more ballots.

I would suggest if we do this again in the future:

APPENDIX C – COMMENTARY ON ALTERNATIVE VOTING METHODS

- * No limit on # of candidates to rank, to prevent premature ballot exhaustion.
- * In an extended ballot where we're all sharing results, those voting last have an incredible information advantage for tactical voting. Results should be secret until voting has closed.
- * If not requiring a majority, establishing a floor for # of votes to be elected. In the end, what we did was for all purposes no different from randomly picking 9 LNC members to each pick one person for the committee, except worse since three of those elected got less than 1 vote.